A CONTEXTUAL ANALYSIS OF BIOMETRIC ATTENDANCE SYSTEMS FOR HEALTHCARE EMPLOYEES IN PUNJAB

[1]Zulfiqar Ali,[2]Amir Saeed,[3]Abdul Sami

ABSTRACT--History of health sector reforms in Punjab, Pakistan is strewn with initiatives based on exogenous culture e.g., NPM to bring about efficiency and effectiveness in the public sector. Biometric attendance System for healthcare employees in Punjab is in line with the trajectory of reforms, based on foreign cultural ideals, under the garb of technology without taking into account the contextual realities. This paper, by using the interpretive methodology, seeks to study the phenomenon of Biometric Attendance System in light of Western cultural ideals e.g., instrumental perspective, modernity, liberal individualism, and autonomy and conclude that such technological solutions are ahistorical and atemporal.

KeyWords--Health Sector Reforms, Western Cultural Ideals, NPM, efficiency, effectiveness, Biometric Attendance System, Instrumental perspective, Individualism, Autonomy, Interpretive.

I. INTRODUCTION

The phenomenon of "Introduction of Biometric Attendance System" in the health sector of Punjab province in Pakistan is a part of Health Sector Reforms Roadmap Program (HSRR)----- a comprehensive health sector reforms package initiated in the province in 2013 (Chief Minister's meeting held on 15-01-2015). It envisages reforms in different aspects of public health care e.g. availability of medicines in emergencies and of health facilities across the Punjab, efficient, transparent and effective procurement of quality medicines, contracting out of non-core services, digitization of key healthcare services (inventory management system); financial & Human Resource requirements and introduction of Biometric Attendance System etc.

Government of the Punjab (GOP), Pakistan instructed Punjab Information Technology Board (PITB) to prepare software to ensure "Biometric Attendance System" for all healthcare employees in Punjab (Minutes of meeting held on 15-01-2015). While giving go ahead for the project, Chief Minister Punjab observed that digitization is the key to improving delivery of health care. GOP has approved PKR 108.242 million till June 2017 to implement

[1] PhD Scholar, Institute of Administrative Sciences, University of the Punjab Lahore, Pakistan,zulfiqar_kharal@yahoo.com.

[2] Assistant Professor, Institute of Administrative Sciences, University of the Punjab Lahore, Pakistan,aamir.ias@pu.edu.pk.

[3] Assistant Professor, Department of Administrative Sciences, University of the Punjab Jhelum Campus, Jhelum, Pakistan, Abdulsami82@gmail.com.

859

biometric attendance system in 38 District Headquarter Hospitals (DHQs) and 104 Tehsil Headquarter Hospitals (THQs) in Punjab. Team PITB has, in coordination with the Director (Management Information System) Health Department, prepared a list of 38 candidates DHQs and 104 THQs for implementation of Biometric attendance system.

Biometric attendance system for health care employees cannot be seen as an isolated event in the administrative history of the province. As a matter of fact, health sector reforms in Pakistan in general and Punjab in particular have a long and involved history. Therefore, this phenomenon can only be appreciated if it is juxtaposed with the history of health sector reforms in the country.

Saeed (2012) argues that health sector reforms in Punjab province of Pakistan have a peculiar colonial context. The country inherited an underdeveloped and weak rather neglected social sector from its colonial past. The situation continues even after the independence of the country. The Point was highlighted by Weinbaum (1996) as well in the following quote:

"Pakistan's political culture is naturally a strong product of its past, including its people's earlier history under the British Raj. What Pakistani leaders knew best from this inheritance was the so-called vice-regal system that made little or no provision for popular awareness or involvement. The system was designed to rule over a subjected population and intended to keep order and collect taxes" (p. 640-41). Health was among the most neglected of the areas in the social sector. The extent of its neglect can be gauged from the fact that its budget was 0.6 percent of the GDP of the country.

Almost all previous health sector reforms were a part of pre-conditions of International financial assistance programs. Silvestre, (2008) observes that "while countries receive loans and financial help from international organizations, they also get packages of policy conditions to receive help". With regard to health sector, International Financial Institutes proposed variety of remedies including standards and accreditation for hospital quality assurance, private health insurance, and hospital autonomy (Makinen, 1993, abstract).

This initiative is being put forth as a landmark decision destined to bring about cultural change in the health sector of the country besides enhancing employee's efficiency and punctuality (Minutes of meeting held on 15-01-2015).

It has been presumed that mere introduction of a technical solution to the human problem of late coming and absenteeism in public sector hospitals would change the whole culture in health care by inculcating efficiency and punctuality among employees. Moreover, the biometric attendance system has been assumed as the most economically efficient one.

Given the significance of the proposed phenomenon and considerable financial cost (PKR 108.242 million till June 2017) to be paid from the public exchequer, this paper will seek to dig deep into the cultural ideals lying underneath the biometric attendance system assessing as to what extent this intervention is likely to achieve the stated objectives of health sector efficiency and effectiveness along with change in organizational culture.

II. PHENOMENON: BIOMETRIC ATTENDANCE SYSTEM IN HEALTHCARE SYSTEM OF PUNJAB

The project document of Biometric Attendance System for Healthcare employees in Punjab reveals following three objectives (Approved summary for the Chief Minister):

(1) Biometric attendance system will promote a culture where all employees check in right on time.

(2) The proposed system costs less than 1% of total non-development budget of Health Department and makes perfect economic sense.

(3) The system enhances employee's punctuality and efficiency by the use of versatile technology.

The proposed system outlines following areas critically important for successful operations in the field:

- Multiple ways to gather attendance including CNIC, dial pad and biometric identification. Biometric identification will be used as primary source.
- Connectivity mode based on fail over mechanism i.e. GSM and WiFi/LAN.
- Ability of the device to send functionality optimization updates in real time.
- Surveillance of devices using IP based cameras.

The document further provides that in order to achieve the desired results through installation of biometric attendance system, monetary incentive package for the concerned staff is also being considered. Service Level Agreement will be signed off till the project completion period i.e. 2017.

Biometric system is primarily an automated use of behavioral and physiological characteristics to determine and verify an identity (Brunelli et al, 1995). It is being used in many countries and variety of organizational settings. Organizations ranging from the law enforcement agencies to hospitals, schools, banks and other work places are using the biometric technology. The system is primarily used for the prevention of fraud in organizations and for identification and authentication of employees. Fraud in organizations may be of different kinds e.g., bank transaction like ATM withdrawals, access to computers and emails, Credit Card purchase, purchase of house, car, clothes or jewellery, getting official documents like birth certificates or passports, obtaining court papers, driving licence and getting into confidential workplace. There are several different biometric attendance technologies being used the world over including Fingerprint, Face Recognition, Hand Geometry, Iris Scan, Voice Scan, Signature, Retina Scan, Infrared Face and Body Parts etc. Besides, there are numerous biometric-enabled authentication applications like doors, cars, laptops and ATM access.

In Pakistan, this technology is already being used in the health sector by the Khyber Pakhtun Khuwa Government.

III. THE CULTURAL IDEALS LYING UNDERNEATH

The instrumental or rational perspective describes human or social behavior primarily from two sources: a scientific ideal and a family of cultural ideals (Bishop, p 83). The scientific ideal is based on the efficient cause and effect interactions and the cultural ideals include instrumental picture of reality, liberal individualism and autonomy.

This has serious implications for collective social good as with money becoming the only driving force or prime motivator people tend to eschew from doing good or desirable actions without monetary benefits. If at all, they do well it is due to 'reciprocal altruism' i.e. quid pro quo or put it simply 'you scratch my back, I scratch yours' (Bishop, 2007, p 91).

According to the instrumental picture, actors engage in means-end reasoning, deliberating among the means independently from or untainted by social context, cultural values and roles, history or other larger perspectives, even apart from what others (will) think about them. Conception of agency is critical to the understanding of instrumental perspective. An agent's purpose originates from his own internal choice as opposed to the wider social, cultural, moral or spiritual community (Bishop, 2007, p 85).

The foremost argument of instrumental or rational choice perspective is that individual behavior in an organization is based on rational calculation of self-interest. The emphasis is on 'self' or individualism as opposed to collectivity. Cultural ideals of autonomy or 'punctual self' (Taylor 1995,) and 'Sovereign self' (Dunne 1996), liberalism (liberal individualism and political liberalism) is lurking behind this overwhelming stress on individualism.

The biometric attendance system is yet another tool in the armory of NPM assuming that humans can only be motivated through positive or negative reinforcement. Humans are reduced to mere means to achieve ends of organization. Human behavior is sought to be modified through quick-fixes----or the most efficient route for a trip (Bishop (2007, p. 82) instead of realizing that humans are self-interpreting beings. Subject-object ontology and epistemology are salient features of this instrumental picture. The concept of 'agent' in the instrumental perspective is not implementable in human or social action as life is not a machine like structure. Besides, it does not explain many of the collective social realities and values like altruism, respect, trust and reciprocity.

In short, Provincial health authorities in Punjab seek to achieve the already identified objectives by using this technological solution of Biometric Attendance System. Automation or use of variety of Information and Communication Technology under NPM reflects the instrumental perspective of being much in harmony with a modern scientific outlook on the world, including making the most effective and efficient choice and its emphasis on technological solutions to humanity's problems (e.g., Comte's third stage of society) (Bishop, 2007, p 83).

This is indicative of instrumental picture of social reality----Max Weber's zweckrational (technical mastery) or means-end approach as described by Bishop (2007, p 82,83). Bishop observed that there are deep cultural reasons to believe that the only action that seems viable is that of technical application, manipulation and control (Bishop, 2007, p. 82 to95).

IV.   THE HISTORIC DEVELOPMENT OF CULTURAL IDEALS IN THE WEST

West has a particular context of development of knowledge. West's peculiar experience with faith during the medieval or the dark ages has shaped many of its existing socio-political, economic and religious concepts.

The pre-modern West had a strong attachment with faith. However, with the advent of modern era, the scientific revolution, faith was replaced in the socio-political debate by autonomy or a kind of 'punctual self' who is only responsible and accountable to himself.

In the words of Steven Kreis (2009), the scientific revolution gave the western world the impression about the superiority of human mind and its progress towards some ultimate end. Man the believer (who believed in religious guidance) had gone and man the knower (one who believed in empirical methods and cause and effect) had emerged. It was man's destiny to both know the world and create the world. He further observed that this new focus on nature was a direct result of the fall of the Christian matrix, the medieval view of world and a combination of forces like Renaissance, Reformation, the Age of Exploration and the spirit of Capitalism.

The history of scientific development is also the history of struggle between faith based medieval world view and scientific rationality. There were incessant infightings among the Catholics, Protestants and heretics during the reformation era. Persecution of many a noble mind during the dark ages of Europe left an indelible mark on the western mind dwindling social space for the religion. It resulted in the internal, moral, value and faith based anchor of an individual being giving in to a free 'self' amenable only to external control mechanisms.

Max Weber traces the roots of technical rationality of modern West to the growth of industrialization and bureaucracy (Bishop, 2007, p 38, 39). The zweckrational (technical rationality) approach focusing entirely on efficiency and effectiveness of means for achieving given ends leads to transition towards instrumental action which has disturbing consequences for social science research as well as government policy founded and informed by such research. The notion of mastery or control over nature and ourselves is characterized as a dominant theme of Enlightenment thinking (seventeenth and eighteenth centuries) (Bishop, 2007, p 43).

Emergence of 'secularism' as a cardinal principle of Western ethos can be rightly ascribed to this tug of war among rival religious factions. One of the basic tenants of secularism was its belief that social knowledge would not be taken from religion and it would remain exclusively within the human domain.

Again, technical rationality is connected to the fundamental question regarding basis of knowledge. Faith was associated with superstitions and ignorance while reason and empiricism was taken as a superior form of knowledge creation. This along with the scientific developments had a profound effect on social sciences which were in an embryonic stage by then.

The Western mind has started seeing social sciences with the lens of natural sciences. Hence, scientific analysis and technology are critical. This scientific way of thinking and analyzing is a process of thought which is technical, mathematical, logical and precise. Steven Kreis(2009) refers to *R. Buckminster Fuller's* following definition of man which is reflective of looking human and social phenomena with a scientific and machine like way:

"Man is a self-balancing ,28 jointed adapter-base biped, and electro-chemical reduction plant, integrated with the segregated stowages of special energy extracts in storage batteries for subsequent activation of thousands of hydraulic and pneumatic pumps, with motors attached; 62000 miles of capillaries, millions of warning signal, railroad and conveyor systems, crushers and cranes, and a universally distributed telephone system needing no service for seventy years if well managed, the whole extraordinary complex mechanism guided with exquisite precision from a turret in which are located telescopic and microscopic self-registering and recording range-finders, a spectroscope, etc.".

V.   ANALYSIS

Over the years, technology has been used as a vehicle to improve efficiency and performance of human resource in public organizations. New Public Management (NPM) has led to further enhance this fascination with technology in the public sector throughout the world. Saeed (2012, p65-66) opines that health sector reforms and hospital autonomy in Punjab was a direct outcome of global emphasis on efficiency driven New Public Management paradigm.

Technology, and particularly information technology, is often said to be a 'central force' in the transformation of contemporary society (Hood, 2000, p 17). Nevertheless, changing employee's behavior is not a mere technical challenge to be resolved through technology, rather, it is a complex human and social phenomenon rooted in a particular context.

Biometric attendance in healthcare institutions of Punjab is a part of public sector automation drive of the provincial government which originates from the perspective of New Public Management (NPM) ----a set of public service reforms aimed at achieving efficiency and effectiveness in the public sector. Quest for efficiency and higher performance by public organizations has been rightly described as a central and recurring theme in government policies and academic research (Boyne, Farrell, Law, Powell, & Walker, 2003; Pollitt & Bouckaert, 2000). Christopher Hood (1991) has linked the rise of NPM with the administrative megatrends, namely, attempts to slow down or reverse government growth, shift towards privatization and quasi-privatization, development of automation and last but not the least development of a more international agenda increasingly focusing on general issues of public management.

Biometric attendance system does not fully comprehend the social or human phenomenon of employee absenteeism as human feelings and sentiments are subject to variety of interpretations. Taylor (1985 b: 15-17) as mentioned in Bishop (2007) argues that the interpretive practice of social science has following three basic characteristics:

I.   The categories of 'sense' or 'coherence'-meaning must apply to the objects of study.

II.   Sense to be relatively distinguishable from its expression or embodiment-same meaning capable of alternative expression.

III.   The 'sense' must be for or by a subject.

The intervention of biometric attendance system is deficient in interpreting human phenomenon and sense making. In contrast to natural science phenomena, humans are self-interpreting beings (Bishop, p 337-338). Our actions cannot be fully understood apart from our attitudes and purposes---these establish or define what our actions are. Social or human phenomena are fundamentally different from natural phenomena. Natural phenomena being based on efficient causation reflect weak world shaping and a positivist or empiricist approach while human or social phenomena being based on particular form of embodiment of bodies, particular form of everyday life, beliefs and sense making is reflective of strong world shaping and interpretive approach.

In the estimation of Taylor (2007), natural science or empirical approach to study human realities of life actually distorts rather than clarifying everyday life. Social phenomena, kinds or actions like family, institutions

or organizations are constructed or created by human beings through their actions. They cannot exist apart from our needs and purposes. Hence, interpretation is critical to understanding human and social behavior.

Hall and Taylor (2003) observed that in order to resolve the health sector issues World Development Report 1993 presented a solution of "investing in Health" which reflected a marked change in the orientation of how healthcare services in resource-poor countries would be delivered. The main thrust of this paradigm shift was the "replacement of Primary Health Care (PHC) by "Health Sector Reforms" based on market forces and the economic benefits of better health".

This was a byproduct of intense debate regarding the performance of public sector. New Public Management was seen as a panacea to the ills that the public sector was marred with. The assumptions behind NPM led reforms were that "Competitive market forces operate more efficiently than a monopolistic state sector; that the role of government should be reduced and confined mainly to security and enforcement; that people behave rationally to maximize profits and are more appropriately served through market competition; and that the government provision of social services is wasteful (Haque, 2007, p. 180).

NPM has put emphasis on 'business type professional managerialism' in public sector requiring a great amount of discretionary powers to achieve results ('free to manage' in line with the 'free to choose' slogan of public choice or rational/instrumentalist perspective) (Hood (1991). Further, NPM doctrine has been perceived to be the agenda of modernization (Lapsley, 1999, 2001a, 2001b, 2009; Lapsley and Pong, 2000; English and Skaerbek, 2007; Broadbent and Guthrie, 2008).

However, there is empirical evidence that use of technological change in the implementation of NPM has not been very successful. Brown (2001) describes e-government in the U.K. as a process of permanent failure. He justifies this permanent failure on three grounds: (a) software development problems, (b) project management problems, and (c) procurement problems. Irvine Lapsley (2009) recommends a closer integration of IT and other reforms and a strategic approach are necessary to achieve successful implementation.

There is a sharp contextual difference between the Western and Pakistani or for that matter South Asian perspective of dignity, respect and motivation. Bishop (2007) noticed that Western mind has a history rooted in the cultural ideals of liberal individualism, punctual self, autonomy and political liberalism.

Following the renaissance and the onset of scientific and industrial revolution, Western thought process underwent a metamorphosis—moving away from religion and after-life focusing more on mundane and worldly ideals. The cultural ideal of instrumental rationality and autonomy is in contrast to the pre-modern emphasis of social self and faith in the West (Durkheim as cited in Bishop (2007, p 105). Resultantly, State in the West has disengaged itself from the moral aspects of human life.

Scholars of public management and administration have laid emphasis on the need to look into the historical, cultural, religious, political and socio-economic past of a country before effectively addressing such administrative problems. Howard J. Wiarda (1981) points to the fallacy of explaining path to modernization in the Third World by referring to the past and present of the already industrialized nations. Path to development and progress is not unilinear. Western terms and concepts may not be relevant to understanding development and modernization in developing countries.

According to Raadschelders (2009), understanding the administrative past is important to anyone as governments are product of human action. Understanding human behavior and its motivation to take particular action, therefore, requires placing that particular action in its temporal and geographical context.

In the words of Cheung (2005, p 267) " In most Southeast Asian countries, public sector jobs provided employment for constituents and opportunities of patronage for political supporters, helping to consolidate the power of ruling elites". This clearly delineates the cultural and contextual difference between the developed countries of the West and the developing countries.

Pakistan, a developing country, has been characterized by Hofstede (1987) as having high "power distance" i.e high level of tolerance for power inequality among various groups. It has a unique socio-political and religious setting. Introduction of biometric attendance system is a technical attempt to interpret, explain and resolve an otherwise social and human phenomenon. This is a recurring mistake in most of the reform history in public sector of the country.

Over the years, reform packages have been introduced without making sense of what happened and without digging deep into the peculiar administrative context of the country. Weick (1995) explains the process of sense making through the concept of cue (a piece of information, content, event or phenomenon occurred in a present situation), frame (a set of background knowledge, a context which may help in understanding of the content) and connection (a link which connects the cue and frame. Simply put, history and context is of critical importance to understanding any of reforms or initiatives in public sector. According to Egger (1953, p 3):

"The deficiencies of public administration of Pakistan are not deficiencies of intelligence or understanding, but are the deficiencies inherent in an administrative system designed for a day that has gone by…the colonial government was a law-and-order government, the function of which, except in time of famine, did not extend appreciably beyond internal tranquility and collecting the revenue".

Public sector reforms in Pakistan have almost always been imported from the West or were influenced by it because of its global impact in recent history. Western culture may be dominantly characterized as one of modernity (Turner, 1990; also Bernstein, 1985; Bauman, 1989 and Rabinbach, 1990). This modernity has technical rationality as its concomitant part which emphasizes scientific – analytical mindset and the belief in technological progress (Barrett, 1979). Technical rationality has close similarity with the notion of 'instrumental reason' (as discussed by Max Horkheimer (1947) – the narrow application of human reason solely in the service of instrumental aims.

Guy B. Adams draws attention towards the concept of "Culture" as applied to the study of organizations. He observes that culture has mostly been utilized in the study of organizations in consistency with technical rationality (Barley, Meyer, and Gash, 1988). Instead of focusing on the larger meaning of culture the organizations exist in, the focus was narrowed to individual organizational culture.

This narrow application of culture is quite evident in the phenomenon of biometric attendance system as it seeks to change the individual's culture in health sector without changing organizational culture and connecting it to the larger context —the overall administrative culture of the province. Public organizations theorists like Christensen et. al. (2007) support the study of public sector reforms from a cultural perspective.

The underlying assumption behind the intervention is that it is only through the use of biometric technology that the challenge of employee absenteeism and late arrival can be adequately addressed and there are no cultural reasons which may necessitate their coming late or, for that matter, lack of motivation etc. Bishop (2007, p 63) refers to the post-modern thinkers like Philip Cushman and observe that human nature is not fixed and ahistorical. Hence, knowledge is local and contextual rather than universal. The post-modern theorist Michael Foucault alludes to the specter of social science as a 'technology' for manipulation and control.

There are variety of actors involved in the implementation of this technological intervention. In the first place there are politicians who want to ameliorate the health sector of the province and get political mileage out it. Medical Superintendents of the DHQs and THQs are taking it as yet another tool to effectively control their subordinate staff. Civil bureaucracy which is at the helm of affairs in the provincial health department views it as an attempt to alleviate tremendous pressure being exerted on them by the Chief Minister's Office after series of ugly episodes like death of infants in the nurseries of DHQs of Sargodha and Vehari. Punjab Information Technology Board (PITB) is a critical party to the biometric attendance system. They want to do it as another step towards automation of the government departments and generate more profit through consultancy. Finally, the employees of these DHQs and THQs are the key stakeholders to the whole project. They see it as an arm-twisting tactics of a regime which is popularly seen as anti-employees. Without comprehending the social interactions among these various different social actors and stakeholders, change in administrative culture will literally be a wild goose chase.

Subjecting people to biometric attendance is dehumanizing as it perpetuates the distance between the top policy makers or the ruling elite and the workers at the front end of the service delivery. It pretty much reflects that though the colonial era is over, present phase is a continuity of this legacy in the shape of neo-colonialism. According to Saeed (2012, p. 52-55) public health issues relating to the locals were largely ignored during the British Era in Subcontinent. There is hardly any fundamental change in the politico-administrative culture of the country ever since independence in 1947. Healthcare system of the country is no exception.

Technical solutions devoid of awareness and understanding of local traditions, culture and socio-political context do not provide a permanent solution to challenges in the health sector personnel management. Bishop (2007) states that social reality has various different facets and can never be fully comprehended through a univocal interpretation like the instrumental/rational choice perspective.

The stated objectives of biometric attendance system do not provide a detailed understanding and sense making of health sector issues in the province of Punjab, Pakistan. It shows complete disregard for the whole socio-political, historical and institutional context of healthcare in the country.

This intervention leaves no room for background history, belief systems and feelings of the employees. Most of the health care employees like other public sector employees are low-paid and under provided. Many of the employees with dependent school or college going girls would prefer dropping their daughters to the school/college themselves given the peculiar cultural sensitivities attached to the social construct of honor attached with the female members of the family. This, more often than not, may lead to their late-coming to their respective stations of duty.

Again, given the peculiar transport and road infrastructure issues in various areas of the province, late coming cannot be ruled out. Arriving late has, otherwise, become a norm with the public sector employees of the country.

Initial feedback of the biometric attendance system reflects a wide spread discontentment among healthcare staff as doctors, nurses and paramedic staff are hardly convinced about the utility of the system leading to a dismal attendance response from many hospitals (Daily Express, 01/09/2015). Perhaps, investing in people and provision of better salary structure sufficient enough to cater to their basic needs will be a far better option for motivating people to be in time and serve the public happily. The intervention does not take into account recurring cost of the installed biometric equipment in shape of ongoing monthly service fees, Repair fees etc. There are serious issues with regard to the reliability of the biometric system as it is never fool proof and there are technical solutions available to crack the code. Pakistan's socio-political and administrative system bears stamp of its peculiar colonial past. Reform initiative that does not take into account these contextual realities may run into further snags in the long run.

VI.   CONCLUSION

The intervention of Biometric attendance provides a naïve, technical solution to an otherwise complex adaptive social challenge of absenteeism and lower turnover in the health facilities. A one size fits for all solution is being applied to a variety of healthcare facilities spread throughout Punjab. It is an outcome of thrust for achieving efficiency and effectiveness through modernity and use of technology or automation in public sector--- a part of New Public Management (NPM) agenda rooted in Western cultural ideals.

As already identified, the phenomenon is reflective of the disguised cultural ideals of instrumental perspective, modernity, technical rationality and autonomous self which are a product of peculiar Western socio-political and cultural realities. These cultural ideals cannot be understood in isolation from the ideology from which it originates. At times, the cultural ideals are hard to identify as they are subtly woven in the policy prescriptions of the donor agencies and foreign governments.

There is a whole host of social realities and human feelings e.g. punctuality, honor, prestige and respect etc. which do not corroborate to rational/instrumental perspective. These ideals are a value laden package as opposed to a value neutral one. Such like instrumental perspective in human and social actions has been empirically and logically challenged by variety of social scientists including Weber, Durkheim and Habermas.

In the context of Pakistan, instead of making use of such instrumental techniques we better fall back upon local cultural ideals and invest in human resource that provide sufficient wherewithal to deal with human actions and behavior. Had there been any contextual and sense making analysis before the introduction of biometric attendance system, genuine issues of the health care employees would have been looked into.

Being part of an overall administrative culture marred with inefficiency and lethargy, healthcare employees cannot be singled out or detached from this broader environment. Organizational efficiency and effectiveness, therefore, is heavily contingent upon the environment outside the healthcare sector.

Even if the whole initiative of biometric attendance system turns into a success story, how would it ensure that the common man visiting government health care facilities would not be subjected to humiliation anymore? That it

would change the entire organizational culture and create efficiency among employees appears to be a gross exaggeration.

Human and social actions cannot be subjected to instrumental rationality. If someone wants to cheat, he will no matter what technical gadgetry is used. Such lasting change is too hard to be wrought by mere scratching on the surface. It can only be acquired by making individuals connected with society, principles and ideology. Ideals of Western culture disguised under the technical innovations are no substitute to the local cultural context of Pakistan. Socio-political fabric of Pakistani society is entirely different than that of Western developed countries. Religion and culture still holds considerable sway on the minds of common man.

The cultural ideals e.g., instrumental rationality, liberal individualism and autonomy are product of a peculiar Western socio-political and religious experience and are disguised under reforms initiatives and technological solutions that developing countries including Pakistan are lured into. Usage of this technology in Pakistan is a-temporal and ahistorical. Hence, alien to the Pakistani context and failing to make sense.

Until and unless human and social behavior is aligned to the context and people are genuinely motivated towards change, there is a little possibility of change being brought about through mere technical interventions like biometric attendance system. Satisfaction of their basic needs will reflect positively on employees' motivation for serving public. Inability of the state to resolve fundamental structural issues directly relevant to employees' motivation is likely to elicit further resistance ending up in failure of such like technological quick fixes as highlighted in the aforesaid news item.

REFERENCES

1. Saeed, Aamir, PhD thesis "Making Sense of Policy Implementation Process in Pakistan: The Case of Hospital Autonomy Reforms" University of Utrecht, The Netherlands

2. Barley, Stephan R., Gordon W. Meyer, and Debra C. Gash, 1988. "Cultures of Culture: Academics, Practitioners, and the Pragmatics of Normative Control" Administrative Science Quarterly, Vol. 33(March), pp.24-60)

3. Barrett, William, 1979, The Illusion of Technique. Garden City, New York: Anchor Doubleday.

4. Bauman, Zygmont, 1989. Modernity and the Holocaust, Ithaca, NY: Cornell, University Press

5. Bernstein, Richard, ed., 1985. Habermas and Modernity, Cambridge MA: MIT Press.

6. Boyne, Farrell, Law, Powell, & Walker, 2003; Pollitt & Bouckaert, 2000

7. Brown, T., 'Modernization or Failure? IT Development Projects in the U.K. Public Sector' Financial Accountability and Management, Vol. 17, No. 4, 2001

8. R. Brunelli, and D. Falavigna, "Personal identification using multiple cues," IEEE Trans. on *Pattern Analysis and Machine Intelligence*, Vol. 17, No. 10, pp. 955-966, 1995

9. Cheung, A. B.L., (2005). The Politics of Administrative Reforms in Asia: Paradigms and Legacies, Paths and Diversities. Governance Volume 18, Issue 2, P. 257-282, April.

10. Christensen et. al. 2007. Organization Theory and the Public Sector, Instrument, Culture and Myth, Routledge.

11. Crown Agents, Making Government Work, DFID PRMP TAMA High Level Review, January 2010, Phase 1 Functional Mapping Interim Draft Report Volume I.

12. Dunne, J 1996 'Beyond Sovereignty and Deconstruction: The Storied Self, Philosophy and Social Criticism 21: 137-57

13. Durkheim, E. 1950, The Rules of Sociological Method (trans. S. A. Solovay and H. J. Mueller, New York, The Free Press [1895]

14. Egger, R. (1953). The Improvement of Public Administration in Pakistan, Government of Pakistan.

15. Express, Daily (2015), Mutaaddad sarkari haspitalon mein hazri ka Bio metric system bhi nakam, 01/09/2015, http://www.express.com.pk/epaper/PoPupwindow.aspx?news ID=1103045480&Issue=NP_LHE&Date=20150901 accessed 2:23 pm 07/09/2015

16. Guy B. Adams, Enthralled with Modernity: The Historical Context of Knowledge and Theory Development in Public Administration, Public Administration Review, Vol. 52, No. 4. (Jul.- Aug., 1992) pp.363-373)

17. Habermas, J. 1971 Knowledge and Human Interests (trans. Jeremy J. Shapiro; Boston: Beacon).

18. Haque, M. S. 2007: Revisiting the New Public Management, Public Administration Review Volume 67, Issue 1, pages 179-182 January/February.

19. Hall, J. J. & Taylor, R. (2003). Health for all beyond 2000: The demise of Alma Ata Declaration and primary health care in developing countries. Global Health MJA Vol. 178, 6 January, 2003, 17-20.

20. Hofstede, G. (1983). National cultures revisited, Cross-Cultural Research ;18; 285.

21. Hood, C. 'A Public Management for All Seasons', Public Administration, Vol. 6, No. 3, 1991.

22. Hood, C., The Art of the State: Culture, Rhetoric and Public Management, Clarendon Press, 2000.

23. Horkheimer, M. 1974. Eclipse of Reason (New York: Continuum Publishers).

24. Howard J. Wiarda, April 1981, The Ethnocentrism of Social Science: Implications for Research and Policy, Review of Politics, Volume 43, Issue 2, pp 163-197

25. Irvine Lapsley, New Public Management: The Cruelest Invention of the Human Spirit?, 2009 p-1

26. Jos C.N. Raadschelders, 2009. Is American Public Administration Detached from Historical Context? On the Nature of Time and the Need to Understand it in Government and its Study. University of Leiden.

27. Mahmood, S. (1990). Bureaucracy in Pakistan: A Historical Analysis. 1st ed. Progressive Publishers, Zaildar Park, Lahore.

28. Makinen, M. (1993). Policy options for financing health services in Pakistan Volume 1: Summary report, Health Financing and Sustaining Project, Abt Associates Inc. Management Sciences for Health, USAID.

29. Minutes of Chief Minister's Meeting, 15-01-2015.

30. Rabinbach, Anson, 1990. The Human Motor: Energy, fatigue and the Origins of Modernity. New York: Basic Books.

31. Robert Bishop, The Philosophy of Social Sciences, 2007, Continuum International Publishing Group

32. Steven Kreis, The History Guide, 2009, Lectures on Modern European Intellectual History, Lecture 6, The Medieval Synthesis and the Secularization of Human Knowledge: The Scientific Revolution, 1543-1642(1)

33. Silvestre, G.J. (2008). A case study of tensions between policy making and implementation of the higher education policies that affect the professoriate at two Argentinean universities. PhD Dissertation, University of Pittsburgh.

34. Summary for the Chief Minister, 24-03-2015.

35. Taylor, C. 1985b, Philosophical Papers, Vol., 2: Philosophy and Human Sciences (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).

36. Taylor, C 1995, Philosophical Arguments (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press).

37. Weber, M. 1949, Max Weber on the Methodology of Social Sciences, (eds & trans. E. Shils and H. Finch; New York: The Free Press.

38. Weick, K. E. (1995). Sense making in Organizations: Sage Publications, Inc. London.

39. Weinbaum, M.G. (1996). Civic Culture and Democracy in Pakistan. Asian Survey, Vol., 36. No. 7(Jul), pp. 639-654