# Factors Influencing the Evaluation Process of Teacher Professional Allowance Policy

# Jeane Tuilan\* and Basikin

Abstract--- The main problem in this study is the performance allowance of the teacher. The purpose of this research is to find out the factors influencing the evaluation process of teacher professional allowance policy (A study at SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon). This research is expected: (1). To be able to develop concepts of public policy theory, especially regarding Teacher Professional Allowance Evaluation Policy in Tomohon City; (2). To be able to increase knowledge about public policy concepts and evaluation, especially being critical in responding to various public problems that occur around us. The researchers took SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon as the research location and used qualitative research, which was conducted in a natural setting, and the data collected was generally qualitative. The results were several factors; (1). The effectiveness that when the teacher has status as a professional, of course, he should also have to work professionally by adjusting with developments, both in terms of ability in the preparation of the material and the mastery of technology as well; (2). Efficiency that this professional allowance is a policy step taken by the government to improve academic qualifications and competencies, and to increase the level of welfare of teachers. This study recommends further research on teacher professional competence in Tomohon City.

Keywords--- Factors, Evaluation, Allowances, Teacher, Professional, Policy.

# I. INTRODUCTION

Developing the nation's intellectual life is one of the objectives of the Republic of Indonesia as clearly stated in the Preamble of the 1945 Constitution of Republic of Indonesia, and the teacher is one of the professions that are very helpful in achieving this objective in an effort to produce intelligent and competent young generations who can compete with other countries.

When the teacher's status is determined as a profession, it has very significant implications in the overall effort of teacher professional development. The main implication is to build professional teachers.

Based on the Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 14 of 2005 Concerning Teachers and Lecturers Article 1, professional teacher is defined as follows: (1) Professional is work or activities carried out by a person and becomes a source of income for living that requires expertise, qualification, or skills that meet specific quality standards or norms and requires professional education. (2) The teacher is a professional educator with the main task of educating, teaching, guiding, directing, training, assessing, and evaluating students in early childhood education through formal education, primary education, and secondary education.

In carrying out a professional duty, the teacher has the right to earn an income above the minimum necessities of life and social welfare guarantees.

Jeane Tuilan\*, Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta. E-mail: jeanetuilan.2019@student.uny.ac.id Basikin, Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta. E-mail: basikin@uny.ac.id

Income above the minimum life includes basic salary, allowances attached to salary, as well as other allowances in the form of professional teacher allowances for teachers, functional allowances, special allowances, and additional issues related to their duties as teachers which are established on the principle of achievement based on achievement.

There are three important aspects of philosophical foundations in teacher professionalization. First, increasing academic qualifications, secondly, increasing competence, and third, increasing teacher welfare. These three aspects have imperative sequences, namely, each teacher must meet the academic qualifications required for a profession. Law No. 14 of 2005 mandates that the prerequisites are bachelor (S1) and diploma IV. Then the competence is a verified educator certificate. These competencies include professional competencies, social competencies, and personality competencies. The fulfillment of these two aspects will be the basis for a teacher to obtain professional allowance, which is an important aspect of teachers' welfare. That is, the sequence cannot be reversed. The philosophy is that qualifications and competencies are prerequisites for the recognition of the professionalism of the teacher for which he has the right to receive professional allowances for his welfare. Instead, the improvement in welfare is then followed by an increase in the quality of teachers, both academic qualifications and competencies. In terms of the economy, the teacher professional allowance is very helpful in improving the welfare of these teachers, but they are also required to have competence, meaning to have the knowledge, skills, and behavior that must be possessed, appreciated, and mastered in carrying out their professional duties.

John Dewey (in Wicaksono 2014: 109) stated that Public policy focuses on the public and its problems. Public policy addresses the issue of how public issues are structured and defined and how they are set on the policy agenda and political agenda.

Lasswell and Kaplan (in Abidin 2005: 20) perceived the policy as a means to an end, calling the policy a program that is projected with regard to goals, values, and practice.

Furthermore, Chandler and Plano (in Pasolong 2010: 38) said that public policy is a strategic use of available resources to solve public or government problems. From the three theories above, it can be concluded that public policy is a means of solving a public or government problem based on existing issues or problems as outlined in a program to achieve a goal. This professional allowance policy is a policy step taken by the government in order to improve academic qualifications and competencies and to increase the level of welfare of teachers.

SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon is one of the schools that has professional teachers. Based on preliminary observations conducted on August 19, 2019, some preliminary findings of the teachers who received professional allowance, have not been able to work professionally by balancing with current scientific and technological advances. As a professional educator, of course, he must be able to balance the allowance received with the quality of teaching. And the second finding is that the amount of the allowance, which is equivalent to the basic salary apparently has not been able to increase the level of welfare of the teachers who received the allowance.

The amount of salary received by professional teachers is actually not a reason when it cannot finance the daily needs of these teachers. Because the amount of allowance received is equivalent to the basic salary as stipulated in Law No.14 of 2005 Article 16 paragraph (2).

Carrying out the tasks as professional teachers requires them to always be updated on the latest information and knowledge through online features that actually help them to be more easily and quickly to find out. Moreover, entering this globalization era, with the professional allowance, it should be more motivating for teachers to be more professional to teach by balancing the development of the current era.

However, based on preliminary observations, it was observed that there were still many teachers at SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon who had not mastered information technology. As a result, the learning process and transfer of knowledge to students met a few obstacles. Based on the results of preliminary observations above, the researcher was interested in conducting research on that problem with the title "Factors influencing the Evaluation of Professional Teacher Allowance Policy (A study at SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon)".

Based on the background of the above problems, the researcher formulated the research problem as follows: What are the factors that influence the evaluation process of Teacher Professional Allowance policy at SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon?

# **II. LITERATURE REVIEW**

### 2.1. Public Policy

John Dewey (in Wicaksono 2014: 109), Public policy focuses on the public and its problems. Public policy addresses the issue of how public issues are structured and defined and how they are set on the policy agenda and political agenda.

#### 2.2. Public Policy Evaluation

Howlet and Ramesh (in Mulyadi 2015: 121) define public policy evaluation as a systematic, empirical assessment of the consequences of an ongoing government policy and program and their compliance with the objectives to be achieved by the policy.

#### 2.3. Policy Evaluation Criteria

In every policy evaluation, there must be constraints faced to hamper the success of the policy. In this case, Operational Theory, which is used as the basis for the analysis of this research, namely the theory of William Dunn (in Mulyadi 2015: 124), which six criteria can be used to assess a successful or unsuccessful performance, namely: (1). Effectiveness, which is concerned with whether an alternative achieved the expected result (effect), or achieved the objective of the action. (2). Efficiency, which is concerned with the amount of effort needed to produce a certain level of effectiveness. (3).

Adequacy, which is concerned with how far a level of effectiveness satisfies the needs, values, or opportunities that create a problem. (4). Equity, which is closely related to legal and social rationality and refers to the distribution of effects and effort between different groups in society. (5). Responsiveness, which regards to how far the policy can satisfy the needs, preferences or values of the community. (6). Appropriateness, which is related to substantive rationality, because questions about this matter do not concern individual units of criteria but two or more criteria simultaneously.

#### 2.4. Public Policy Implementation

Implementation is oriented towards actions to achieve the goals set in a decision. There are some important things in preparing for the implementation process, which are as follows: (1). Preparation of resources, units, and methods of implementing them. (2). Preparation of policies, which are acceptable and implementable plans and directives. (3). Procurement of services, payment processing, and other things required.

#### 2.5. Regulation on Professional Teacher Policy

Law Number 14 Year 2005 Concerning Teachers and Lecturers emphasizes that teachers and lecturers are required to have academic qualifications, competencies, educator certificates, physically and mentally healthy, and meet other qualifications, required by the higher education unit where they are assigned to work and have the ability to realize educational goals national.

This law is considered to be a legal protection for teachers and lecturers without any different treatment between public and private teachers. This law obviously regulates in detail aspects, that so far have not been regulated in detail. For example, the position, functions, and objectives of the teacher, the rights and obligations, competence, et cetera. But unfortunately, there are still several weaknesses and shortcomings found in the Law, and still, a problem and debate that never ends. Starting from the voices of unclear articles, up to some improvement in the quality and welfare of education, as outlined in the Law. Many pessimists still argue that the government will not be willing to spend budget to exchange it for the quality of education, moreover, the welfare of teachers who are already familiar with that suffering. Besides, the implementation process is still not optimal, the target that can be achieved is only a few things from all statements contained in the Law. These responses reveal significant changes in most motivations and aspirations through teacher education courses, with all changes to the top. That is, the influence of motivation is considered to have become more influential over time, and higher aspirations (Basikin: 2007).

# **III. METHODOLOGY / MATERIALS**

Basically, qualitative research is conducted in a natural setting, and the data collected is generally qualitative. Therefore, this research is called qualitative research. According to Sugiyono (in Pasolong 2013: 161), qualitative research is a research method used to examine the condition of natural objects, as opposed to experiments, where researchers are key instruments, data collection techniques are carried out by triangulation (combined), emphasizing the meaning of generalization.

Researchers took the location of the study in SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon. The focus of this research related to the formulation of the research problem and the focus area was temporary because it could change at the time the research was conducted. It is said to be a temporary focus because initially, it is still general and vague, it will become clearer and more focused after the researcher is in the field (Bogdan and Bilken, in Targets, 2011: 83). The research was as follows: Factors influencing the evaluation of teacher professional allowance policy in the Tomohon City, and the factors in the policy evaluation process in this study, used an operational theory for the basis of analysis using William Dunn's theory (in Mulyadi 2015: 124).

# **IV. RESULTS AND FINDINGS**

### 4.1 Evaluation of Teacher Professional Allowance Policies at SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon

In this study, regarding the Evaluation of Professional Teacher Allowance Policy in SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon, Tomohon City used Operational Theory, according to Law No. 14 of 2005, Chapter II Article 4, namely the position of the teacher as a professional as referred to article 2 paragraph (1) serves to improve the dignity and role of the teacher as a learning agent functions to improve the quality of national education.

The results of research conducted by researchers can be described and analyzed below:

- a) The teacher as a professional has a special allowance that was received quarterly four times a year, which was equivalent to the basic salary. And of course, the income earned by these teachers has increased 1-time every month.
- b) When receiving allowance, as a professional, the teacher should be able to adjust the teaching system with increasingly rapid technological development.

# 4.2 Inhibiting factors in the Evaluation Process of Teacher Professional Allowance policy at SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon

In every policy evaluation, there must be constraints faced to hamper the success of the policy. In this case, Operational Theory, which was used as the basis for the analysis of this research based on the theory of William Dunn (in Mulyadi 2015: 124), six criteria can be used to assess a successful or unsuccessful performance, namely:

- a. Effectiveness
- b. Efficiency
- c. Adequacy
- d. Equity
- e. Responsiveness
- f. Appropriateness

However, not all of these six indicators would be used, because based on the problems that researchers found in the field later, it would be considered which indicators were suitable to be used to recognize the constraints that exist in this evaluation.

Based on the research data in the field concerning the inhibiting factors in the evaluation of professional teacher allowance policies in SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon, which were then linked to the theory presented by William Dunn regarding the criteria in the evaluation of public policy. There are six indicators suggested by Dunn namely effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and appropriateness. However, of the six indicators, only four were used, namely effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, and responsiveness. The reasons for not using equality and appropriateness indicators because when it was explored, that equality was about income, educational opportunities or was about public services recommended on the basis of equality, while appropriateness referred to the value or price of program goals and the strength of the assumptions underlying these goals, and researchers assume that these indicators are the same as the focus determined on the first indicator. Creativity is one of the basic human needs, namely the need for self-actualization and is the highest need for humans. Maslow in Munandar (2009). According to Munandar (1985), creativity is the ability to make new combinations, based on data, information or existing elements. The results created are not always new things, but can also be a combination of things that already exist. Rhodes in Munandar (2009) analyzed more than 40 definitions of creativity, concluding that creativity is generally formulated in terms of the person, process, product, and environment that pushes an individual to the creative behavior.

Based on the three theories above, it can be concluded that creative is an activity carried out by humans individually or in groups in order to create something interesting. The first indicator in this study is effectiveness, in this case, the researcher focuses on whether the results achieved by the teachers who receive the allowance is in accordance with Law No. 14 of 2005 Chapter II Article 4.

Creative, it is what actually wanted by the Principal of SMP Negeri 6 and by the Education and Culture Office from teachers who have received the allowance. Given the current technological advances that are increasingly rapidly forcing people to be able to balance it. Especially, after receiving the title as professional teachers, they are required to be professionals in all fields. The amount of allowance received should be a motivator for them to learn more in order to improve the quality of their teaching in front of the class, to achieve the quality of national education

When a teacher has an additional salary in the form of allowances, it means that the income he earns also increases, although it is one of the factors of the issuance of this policy, it seems to be the second benchmark, because the quality of the teachers becomes the first measurement in this policy.

At present, the government demands that teachers to be professional at work. It shows a reflection of the increasingly comprehensive guidance with the development of the current era, both the government, school leaders, and even students expect it from teacher to fully work with responsibility, quality, not merely as long as it is implemented.

According to Saud (2008), the Profession is a position or job that requires expertise from its members. It means that it cannot be carried out by the one who is not trained and is not specifically prepared to do the work. Expertise is obtained through what is called professionalization, which is carried out both before a person goes through the profession (education/training/pre-service) or after undergoing a profession (in-service training). While professionalism refers to the commitment of members of a profession to improve their professional skills and continuously develop strategies used in doing work according to their profession. Broadly speaking, the theory means that a profession cannot be merely given to anyone. Because it has to go through a variety of special training to obtain his profession, in contrast to professionalism, when a person is said to be professional, it means that he can continuously improve his abilities to adjust to his profession.

It can be observed, that to become a professional teacher, one must go through some training and of course, must be adjusted to the talent he has. Teachers who have served as professional staff must behave like professionals, to be professional means being professional in all fields by not only developing his field of study but also having to be professional with the existing development of science and technology. The second indicator in this study is about efficiency, in this case, the researcher focused on how the efforts of the teachers who have received the allowance in improving teaching and learning methods in SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon.

Similarly, as explained by Saud, a professional must be able to develop the capabilities possessed continually, likewise the teachers who received the allowance should do. However, different facts were found, the teachers who received the allowance at SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon, were not yet able to be creative in meeting the needs of professional teaching staff. Factors of age and facility become inhibiting factors for them to develop. They also complained that the allowance received could not meet the needs above the average, especially to buy the media. The amount of income they are currently earning is only enough to pay for their day-to-day needs and fund their children's education at the tertiary level.

Hygiene factors are important occupational factors for motivation at work. This factor does not lead to positive satisfaction in the long run. But if these factors are missing, then dissatisfaction appears. These are extrinsic factors for work. These are also referred to as dissatisfies or maintenance factors that are needed to avoid dissatisfaction. Hygiene factors are a picture of the physiological needs of individuals that are expected to be fulfilled. They include health, personal life, quality of supervision, working conditions, job security, interpersonal relationships, company policy, and administration.

The same thing that the researchers discussed in the third indicator, adequacy. In this case, the researcher focused on how much the results achieved from the teacher professional allowance policy.

Implementation is oriented towards actions to achieve the goals set in a decision. There are some important things in preparing for the implementation process, which are as follows:

- 1. Preparation of resources, units, and methods of implementing them.
- 2. Preparation of policies, which are acceptable and implementable plans and directives.
- 3. Procurement of services, payment processing, and other things required.

According to Gordon (in Pasolong 2010: 58), the implementation, with regard to various activities, directed at the realization of the program. Van Meter and Van Horn (in Wahab, 1991: 51) define the implementation of policy, as an action taken either by individuals or officials or groups of government or private that is directed to the achievement of the objectives outlined in the policy decision.

Zainal Abidin (in Mulyadi 2015: 25-26) suggested the approaches in public policy implementation, including:

1. Structural Approach

This approach perceives the role of an institution or organization as being crucial. If the organization is deemed incompatible with the forms of changes resulted from the policy, it needs to be done:

a. Planning of change, planning relating to the implementation of policies to make internal changes to the organization.

b. Planning for change, namely planning about organizational change to deal with changes from outside.

#### 2. Procedural/managerial approach

This approach perceives the implementation in the form of implementation stages taken (planning, programming, budgeting, supervision, or programming, evaluation, review technique. The most important thing in the implementation process are priorities and sequences.

#### 3. The behavioral approach

This approach is related to people's acceptance or rejection of a policy. Public acceptance of the policy is not only determined by the content or substance of the policy, but also by the approach in the delivery and how to implement it.

#### 4. Political approach

The success of a policy is determined by the willingness and ability of the dominant forces in society or organizations.

From the theories above, it can be said that the implementation of policies regarding the activities of a government organization and the community in perceiving developments or in carrying out a public policy that has been passed.

The teachers who received professional allowance in SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon have not been able to implement and to make a total effort in learning the technology media. The dissatisfaction of these policy stakeholders was clearly expressed by them. By considering the development of the current era, which is all technology-based, then teachers who have a status as professional teachers should also balance it in the teaching and learning process. The lack of understanding of senior teachers in using technology is one of the inhibiting factors in technology-based teaching activities, whereas these professional allowances should be a reference for them to work professionally as well. They must balance between allowance and the teaching quality and performance. Based on the evaluation, it was found that there were diligent and lazy teachers, and there were qualified and unqualified teachers.

According to Saud (2008), learning media is a learning tool used as an intermediary in the learning process to enhance effectiveness and efficiency in achieving learning objectives

1. The skill objective of using learning media, namely:

- a. Clarifying the presentation of messages to be too verbal
- b. Overcoming the limitations of space, time, and senses
- c. Accelerating the learning process
- d. Generating the excitement of learning
- e. Giving opportunities for students to interact directly with the environment and reality
- f. Giving opportunities for students to learn independently according to their abilities and interests.

Based on this theory, it can be concluded that learning media is one of the important factors in the course of teaching and learning activities, both students and teachers will more quickly deliver and accept the contents of the material presented.

Related to the fourth indicator, which is about responsiveness, in this case, the researcher focused the question to students about how the quality of teaching methods used by teachers in SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon, and from the results of research data that researchers encountered in the field that in general students wanted the learning methods using electronic aids, because according to them, their school has not been able to balance with other schools, which in general have often used electronic media, in this case, LCD and laptops. When the teacher used the tools, it will greatly facilitate the teaching-learning process in the classroom, they do not need to shout to explain, and students are not difficult to hear because everything has been displayed via the LCD. Until now, the teaching-learning method used by the teachers at SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon is still based on a manual using only printed books and props. It was again stated that the lack of school facilities and also technological literacy became an inhibiting factor in this study.

Related to this research, Alinatul Khusna conducted research entitled "Comparative Study Between Uncertified Teachers and Teachers Who Have Certified the Professionalism of Natural Science Teachers in Kepanjen Elementary School Malang" (May 2013) using qualitative research methods. The results obtained from this study that in several educational institutions in the Malang area, the teacher certification, especially the certification of Natural Sciences (IPA) teachers occurred. The developments of this certification in Malang is pretty good, although there were still Natural Science (IPA) teachers who had not yet participated in the certification program. By joining the teacher certification program, the achievements experienced by students had also increased. Although on the other hand, there were still teachers who had participated, did not have the same competence as teachers who have not participated in the program. To improve the teacher's professional capacities, it is necessary to carry out certification and competency testing periodically so that performance continues to improve to meet professional requirements.

The difference in this research lies in the focus of the issues raised. The research above focused on the difference between teachers who were certified and were not. Whereas my research, it focused more on the Evaluation of the Teacher Professional Allowance policy. His results of the study showed good results that where the certification teachers made a good impact for teachers and students, in contrast to the research that I examined, namely the results obtained that the teachers who received the allowance have not been able to balance the allowance received with the quality presented in the field. And the similarity lied in the research method, which was qualitative.

If related to Hassan Subhan's research with the research title "Implementation of Teacher Certification Policy in Jatibarang 1 High School and 1 Juntinyuat High School in Indramayu Regency" (January 2012), the results of his research on the implementation of the teacher certification policy at Jatibarang 1 High School and 1 Juntinyuat High School have not been implemented effectively there were still many teachers who did not really understand the procedures and mechanisms for teacher certification. Also, the lack of communication and bureaucratic structures and SOPs in these schools often change, hampering the implementation of the teacher certification policy.

The difference with this research lies in the focus of the research. This research discussed the Implementation of Teacher Certification Policy, while in my research, I discussed the evaluation. Then the similarity in this study, first,

the damages produced by the teachers who received allowances in SMP Negeri 2 Tomohon have not been maximized, and the second one is the same - using a qualitative research approach.

# **V.** CONCLUSION

To improve the level of welfare of teachers who received professional allowances, the government issued Law No. 14 of 2005 Concerning Teachers and Lecturers, which regulates the professional allowance. When a teacher gets an allowance equal to the basic salary, then his income will certainly increase. But considering the current reality, the prices of goods in the market are rising, making the teachers who received allowance could only finance the basic needs. According to them, this allowance has not been able to meet the various needs in accordance with the progress of the current era. However, when compared to the minimum standard of living in Indonesia, it is clear that the opinions of these teachers regarding the inadequacy of this standard that Teacher Professional Allowance can improve teacher welfare.

# REFERENCES

- [1] Abidin, Zainal. (2005). Kebijakan Publik (Edisi Revisi Cetakan Ketiga). Jakarta: Suara Bebas
- [2] Mujtahid. (2011). Pengembangan Profesi Guru. Malang: UIN-Maliki Press.
- [3] Munandar, S.C.U. (2009). Pengembangankreativitasanakberbakat. Jakarta: PT Rineka Ciptadan Dep. *Pendidikandan Kebudayaan*
- [4] Munandar, S.C.U. (1985). Mengembangkan Bakatdan Kreativitas Anak Sekolah. *Jakarta: PT Gramedia*.
- [5] Nurdin, Syafruddin. (2003). Guru Profesionaldan Implementasi Kurikulum. Jakarta: Ciputat Press.
- [6] Pasolong, Harbani. (2010). Teori Administrasi Publik. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- [7] Pasolong, Harbani. (2013). Metode Penelitian Administrasi Publik. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- [8] Saud. (2008). Pengembangan Profesi Guru. Bandung: Alfabeta
- [9] Sugiyono. (2012). Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- [10] Syafiie, K, Inu. (1997). Ilmu Administrasi Publik. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
- [11] ...... (2012). Profesionalisme Guru.
- [12] Tangkau, Charles. (2011). Modul Metodologi Penelitian. Tondano: Universitas Negeri Manado.
- [13] Wahab, Solichin. (1991). Analisis Kebijaksanaan, Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- [14] Wicaksono, Kristian.(2014). Telaah Kritis Admnistrasi & Manajemen Sektor Publik di Indonesia. *Bandung: Gava Media.*
- [15] Yamin, Martinis.(2013). Sertifikasi Profesi Keguruan di Indonesia. Jambi: Gaung Persada
- [16] Basikin, Watt, Ricardson. 2007. "Beginning Teachers' Motivations and Aspirations through Teacher Education". *Arizona: EAC 2007 Poster*.
- [17] Law No. 14 of 2005 Concerning Teachers and Lecturers.
- [18] Law No. 20 of 2003 Concerning National Education System.
- [19] Government Regulation No. 19 of 2005 Concerning the implementation of Law No. 20 of 2003.
- [20] Government Regulation No. 74 of 2008 Concerning Teachers, which contains provisions concerning the professionalization of teachers.
- [21] Directorate General of Teachers and Education Educator of North Sulawesi Province.
- [22] Minahasa Regency Recipient of Junior High School Level Professional Profession Allowances in 2017.