

Quality in the electronic governance system

Ahmed A. AL-IMARAH,¹ Adnan Mahmoud Ibrahim²

Abstract: *The issue of electronic governance is one of the important topics that have attracted the attention of various international organizations, including production and service, due to the success achieved by applying electronic governance in the public and private sectors. In addition, governments have launched a large number of initiatives to implement e-governance in an attempt to achieve good governance.*

Therefore, this study considers the most important dimensions and principles of quality that must be included in e-governance systems to achieve success in their application. The present study conducts a number of official interviews with experienced and specialized personnel in providing governmental services in the Iraqi Ministry of Health to benefit from professional experience in the field of work, as well as a review of the literature and the most important studies related to the two study variables.

Keywords: *E-Governance, quality of services.*

I. INTRODUCTION

The rapid developments in the field of information and communications technology have brought about major changes in the management of institutions. Among the most prominent of these developments is the application of electronic governance systems, which have contributed greatly to achieving efficiency, effectiveness and transparency in performing the work of these institutions and have become a means by which to obtain competitive advantage.

This shift in the field of management was not limited to private institutions only, but governments also looked to implement electronic governance systems to achieve efficiency in providing their services. Therefore, it has become necessary for governments to consider the best means for the proper application of electronic governance systems. From this standpoint, the present study sought to consider the most important principles and dimensions of quality management that can be applied in electronic governance systems to achieve the success of applying electronic governance systems with the inclusion of experiences of stakeholders in the Ministry of Health due to its importance in achieving efficiency and effectiveness in providing electronic governance systems services, achieving effectiveness in organizational performance, and gaining the satisfaction of the beneficiaries of their use of electronic governance systems applications.

This study includes three sections. Section one includes the methodology of the study. Section two includes the concept of electronic governance, its importance, and the most important dimensions. It also tackles the concept of the quality of electronic governance systems, their importance, and their dimensions. Section three includes the practical side which tackles the important quality indicators extracted from the analysis of the Qualitative data.

Section one

II. THE STUDY METHODOLOGY

First; The problem of the present study

The shift from paper-based processes to the use of information and communication technology is subject to a number of pressures on institutions. These pressures relate to the availability of quality standards in their electronic services.

It is worth noting that most attempts to implement e-governance may not achieve their objectives as it does not meet the needs of the beneficiaries and their expectations of the service, and the lack of a database that enables the beneficiary to interact and participate in the policies. Thus, the competition has become according to what the e-governance services achieve in terms of reliability, response in a timely manner, sympathy with the beneficiaries and information security. Hence, it is possible to formulate the problem of the present study as follows;

How far do the dimensions and principles of quality management contribute to the successful implementation of the e-governance system?

¹ ^{1,2} Faculty of Administration and Economics, University of Kufa-Iraq

¹Email: ahmed.imarah@uokufa.edu. ²Adnan_mahmoud35@yahoo.com

Within this problem, the following sub-questions are included

1. Can the electronic government system include principles and dimensions of quality?
2. What are the most identical dimensions and principles in the stages of the e-governance system?

Second; The significance of the present study

The study is important due to the importance of the role played by the application of the principles and dimensions of quality management in the success of the application of electronic governance systems, especially in the government services sector. This study tries to develop many tools. The two researchers believe that these tools are important to provide quality in the application of electronic governance systems, especially in the field of services. As well as clarifying the concept and importance of quality management and electronic governance as two variables of the study.

In the practical side, the study provides a way to include quality in e-governance systems by identifying the most important indicators that those with expertise and specialization believe that they are necessary to include in order to achieve quality in e-governance services.

III. THIRD; THE AIMS OF THE STUDY

This study aims to achieve a number of objectives as follows:

1. Providing a theoretical and practical framework for government institutions on including the dimensions and principles of quality in the e-governance system.
2. Identifying the most important indicators that can be applied to achieve quality in the application of electronic governance systems.
3. Identifying the most important factors affecting the successful implementation of e-governance.
4. Identifying the extent of the success of the application of the e-governance system in the organization from the point of view of experts and specialists.

IV. FOURTH; THE METHODOLOGY

The study relied on the qualitative approach as it fits with its trends. In a serious attempt to explore new indicators that can be included in electronic governance systems to achieve quality and ensure successful application, it relied on a series of references and previous studies as well as conducting a number of interviews with experts and specialists in the Iraqi ministry of health and qualitative analysis of data using the model (Ary et al, 2010: 281).

Section two

The theoretical side

First; electronic governance

1. The concept of electronic governance

E-governance is one of the important issues that modern institutions care about with their various activities in an effort to achieve efficiency and effectiveness and achieve an advanced level of performance excellence and gain the satisfaction of stakeholders. E-governance is defined as the application of information and communication technology in government operations to enhance performance and achieve governance. It is smart, responsible, responsive, and transparent (Patel et al, 2012: 1). In this definition, it is noted that the focus is on using governance as a tool to enhance the performance of institutions and achieve smart governance in those institutions using information and communications technology. (Ming et al, 2013: 1) defines it as the use of information and communication technology to interact between companies, citizens, and government institutions and provide services to them with the aim of improving transparency, increasing the efficiency of public service, and deepening democracy. Thus, it is a means of achieving democracy and participatory decision-making in services. (Suri and Surihil, 2017: 5) defines it as an important means of introducing administrative reforms and improving the quality of life for the disadvantaged sectors of society, ensuring the most equitable economic opportunities for all throughout the country. (David, 2018: 65) believes that governance is a new way to manage the processes in which information and communication technology plays an active and important role. Thus, it is not limited to achieving a specific objective, but it is rather considered a new way to manage organizations as a whole.

2. The importance of electronic governance

E-governance is of great importance for governments, private institutions, and all users because it provides easy access to information, participation in decision-making, and monitoring government performance by stakeholders.

(Patel et al, 2012: 1) indicates the importance of electronic governance with the following:

1. Creating a strong and effective information base; Stakeholders can benefit from the e-governance project to obtain effective information very easily, such as information related to statistics.
2. Providing quick and convenient services to citizens; E-governance is an effective way to provide quick services to users, such as issuing ID cards and passports for citizens of the country.

3. Integration of communities; e-governance works to strengthen the link and communication between the various government institutions, private institutions, and citizens, reduce the gap between these institutions and beneficiaries, and increase trust between them.

4. Effective use of resources; the use of resources can be higher in light of e-governance. Governments become accountable to citizens for their performance and future plans, which increases productivity and efficiency in government work; Being accountable for its expenses, performance and plans.

5. Reducing delay and reducing red tape; e-governance provides an opportunity to improve the delivery of public services. Most management practices depend on the redesign and convergence process that e-governance facilitates.

3. Dimensions of electronic governance

E-governance in the public sector has a set of main dimensions as follows (Savic, 2006: 33):

A. Standards of behavior

The standards of behavior are linked to the way departments practice leadership, which is represented by high standards of behavior to serve as a role model. The mandatory rules of conduct for all employees must be fitness, objectivity, and integrity, as they reflect the culture of the organization.

B. Organizational structures and processes

They are the set of principles that define the methods of appointing and organizing senior management, and how to define their responsibilities and accountability including legal accountability, communicating with stakeholders transparently and objectively, not concealing facts, and defining roles and responsibilities.

C. Monitoring

The monitoring dimension requires a set of tools and methods to support the objectives, effectiveness, efficiency, and compliance with applicable laws and regulations, and internal policies that are represented by:

- Risk management; It is the effect of the risks associated with achieving the objectives to identify potential threats and opportunities.
- Internal auditing; It should be based on professionalism, independence and objectivity.
- Auditing committees; To audit accounts and the extent of representation to facts.
- Internal Control; A process designed to provide reasonable assurance of achieving objectives in efficient operations in reliable compliance with laws and regulations.
- Budgeting; It is an integrated process with accounting, financial reporting and evaluation.

D. Preparing external reports;

The senior management is required to prove its financial responsibility for overseeing public money and its performance in the use of resources, usually by using the following means:

- Preparing annual reports; It should be in time to include the financial statements, their position, performance, and prospects.
- Using appropriate accounting standards; They are the International Accounting Standards.
- Performance measures; The accrual rather than cash accounting associated with measuring non-monetary performance; what is delivered - outputs, what it costs - inputs, and what is achieved - outputs.

Second; The quality of services

1. The concept of quality of service

Quality, at its most basic definition, is defined as conformance to specifications and requirements (Crossby, 1980: 8). (Chandrupatla, 2009: 2) defines it as the degree to which performance fulfills expectations, fulfills the desires and expectations of customers and beneficiaries with the goods and services, and even exceeds those needs in some cases.

Quality of service is defined as the gap between customer perceptions of the services provided and the expected quality (Parasuraman et al, 1985: 42). (Lewis and Mitchell, 2006: 13) define it as the extent to which the service meets customer needs or expectations. It is also defined as customer perception as a result of comparing customer expectations with the services that the organization must provide against their perception of the performance provided by the service organization as shown by the following equation (Loke et al, 2011: 25).

Quality of service = customer perception - customer expectations

(Jeyalakshmi and Meenakumari, 2016: 23) define it as a comparison between customer expectations of service level and perceived performance.

(Linda, 2012: 43) defines it as a standard for the degree of congruence between actual performance and customer expectations for the service on an ongoing basis in order to ensure lasting satisfaction of customers and achieve the competitive advantage of institutions.

2. The importance of quality of services

Quality has become something that institutions must work towards to achieve efficiency, excellence in performance, and conformity to standards, regulations and laws. The quality process is related to improving the effectiveness of individuals, groups, and the organization as a whole. The institutions work to provide quality requirements from material, human and organizational capabilities and means of communication in order to secure communication between the various levels of organizational and senior management on the one hand, and stakeholders on the other hand. (Dirkra, 2001: 194) demonstrated the importance of quality of services with the following:

A. Growth of the service field; With the increasing needs, technological progress and global openness, the need for a stronger and more dynamic services sector in meeting and forecasting needs arises. That is why quality contributes to creating more flexible and resilient institutions to achieve customer satisfaction and achieve outstanding performance.

B. Achieving a competitive advantage; By following the quality strategy, institutions achieve a competitive advantage by committing to continuous improvement, focusing on training, education, exchanging experiences, communicating with beneficiaries, identifying their desires, and following all the methods that work to retain beneficiaries and gain their loyalty for the longest period possible.

C. Ensuring strong relationships with the beneficiaries; Providing high-quality services at reasonable prices is not sufficient to achieve the objectives in the services sector because the services have the advantage of not separating the service from the provider. Accordingly, achieving quality in the services comes from strong relationships with the beneficiary to get to know Their desires and benefit from the comments they make that contribute greatly to the growth of the service.

D. Economic significance of quality of services; Quality of service has direct effects on profits as it achieves less waste and damage and shortens time and effort, as well as it achieves the loyalty of the beneficiaries in providing services, which contributes significantly to achieving profits and achieving a competitive advantage (Zeithaml, 2000: 1).

3. Dimensions of quality of services

Institutions work to achieve a set of objectives through pre-defined dimensions. A number of authors have shown these dimensions (Berry et al, 1994: 42; Linda, 2012: 45) as follows:

A. Reliability; It refers to the ability to perform service and fulfill promises.

B. Confidence; It is a key factor in ensuring the ability of institutions to provide quality of services that meet the desires of their customers.

C. Empathy; it means giving adequate care to clients and showing willingness to fulfill their desires.

D. Responsiveness; It represents the desire to reach customer needs and achieve them with the necessary speed and flexibility.

E. Credibility; It means the customer's assurance of the institution's credibility in performing its obligations with a high degree of confidence.

F. Tangibility; It means physical facilities, equipment, personnel, communication materials and service facilities.

(Laxmikumar et al, 2014: 92) showed a set of dimensions of quality, including:

A. Performance quality; It is one of the main operating characteristics that determines the performance of the intended product or service

B. Matching; It means that the service meets the specifications or standards.

C. Aesthetic; It means the sensual property, such as the external appearance.

D. Reputation: It is the previous performance and other intangible things, such as ranking in the first place.

Section three

Quality in the electronic governance system

Before going into the development of a quality service strategy for the Iraqi Ministry of Health, according to the e-governance system and the work of the ministry as a whole, it is necessary to focus on the most important tools that can be used to enhance the quality of the governance system. The two researchers reviewed the most important theoretical sources of e-governance, quality of services, and comprehensive quality management. They did not find fixed, specific, and applicable quality dimensions in all e-governance systems. Accordingly, the two researchers collected a set of general dimensions and indicators from different literature, as well as the reports of the ministry, and the information obtained from official appetizers, which are appropriate to the work environment and the need of the ministry. Tables (1,2) show indicators that can be used to enhance the quality of the e-governance system.

Table (1) The indicators adopted in enhancing the quality of services strategy by relying on the literature and the indicators for each of them.

No.	The indicator	Index type	Understood	Recourses
-----	---------------	------------	------------	-----------

1.	Reliability	Dimensions of the quality of services	It is the ability to perform service and fulfill promises. And find solutions to the problems of the beneficiaries with regard to the service, and it represented an important and influential element in the awareness of the quality of services by the beneficiaries and their loyalty to the institution.	(Ramya et al, 2019:40)
2.	Responsiveness	Dimensions of the quality of services	It is the desire to help the beneficiaries and provide them with prompt services. The response is rapid in dealing with the needs of the beneficiaries and responding to questions and complaints, and the extent of the ability of the electronic service provider to provide the service in a timely manner.	(Ramya et al, 2019:40;)
3.	Empathy	E-Governance Quality Dimensions	It means giving adequate care to the beneficiaries and showing willingness to meet their needs. After sympathy focuses on a wide range of services that meet the needs of those who benefit from them, individual or personal services or a specific group and so on.	(Ramya et al, 2019:40)
4.	Tangibles	Dimensions of the quality of services	It means physical facilities, equipment, personnel, communication materials, facilities and communications materials, and unique technology. This provides sufficient hints for the beneficiaries about the quality of the institutions' service	(Ramya et al, 2019:40)
5.	Customer focus	Dimensions of the quality of services	Focus on beneficiaries' needs and meet their expectations	Mehmood et al, 2014:669
6.	Reputation	Dimensions of total quality management	Ensuring the provision of goods and services to enhance the reputation of institutions in the first place	Laxmikumari et al ,2014:94
7.	Conformance	Dimensions of total quality management	Conforming performance with specifications or service standards and using methods, systems and regulations to measure and evaluate service	Laxmikumari et al ,2014:94)Savic,2006:33(
8.	Standards of behavior	Dimensions of total quality management, dimensions of electronic governance	Fitness, objectivity, integrity and transparency	(Savic,2006:33)
9.	Communication			(Parasuraman et al,1985:15)

Source; The two researchers relying on the mentioned sources for each indicator.

The two researchers also relied on a set of indicators concluded from the analysis of personal interviews and the analysis of documents, records, and reports of the institution in addition to the strategic plans prepared to improve the quality of service, which are consistent with the work environment and the need of the institution as in table (2).

Table (2) The approved indicators in enhancing the quality of services strategy based on the analysis of personal interviews and the analysis of documents and reports of the institution and the strategic plans and the indicator for each of them.

No.	The indicator	Index type	concept	Source
1.	(Information Security)	Principles of e-governance	The most important issues to consider in designing an e-governance system for information security	Personal interviews
2.	(Spatial distribution)	Principles of spatial development	"We must work according to the principle of spatial development to reduce the disparity in the distribution of services. The provision of infrastructure according to spatial development contributes to raising the level of quality of services and thus achieving human development."	Personal interviews
3.	Continuous improvement	Principles of total quality management.	In order to achieve quality, we must continue to train working staffs on the latest technologies and keep pace with modernity in information and communications technology."	Personal interviews (Samat et al 2006)
4.	Participation of beneficiaries	Keeping out the quality.	For the success of the development plans, it is necessary to involve all parties that benefit from the services and those working in providing them."	Personal interviews Mehmoodetal, 2014: 569
5.	Reducing poverty	The objectives of the poverty alleviation strategy	Reducing poverty, securing educational and health services, and reducing maternal and child mortality, as well as medium and long-term strategic objectives.	Poverty Reduction Strategy 2018-2022
6.	Reducing maternal mortality rates	Objectives of the Ministry of Health	Improving maternal health	Annual Statistical Report 2018
7.	Reducing child mortality rates below 5	Objectives of the Ministry of Health	Improving children under 5	Annual Statistical Report 2018

Source; The two researchers relying on the mentioned sources for each indicator

Accordingly, the indicators mentioned in the tables above are presented at each stage of the system as follows:

1- Quality at the input stage

Inputs into the e-governance system are statistical data on population projections, numbers of health institutions, maternal mortality ratios, and under-five mortality rates in addition to poverty line ratios by district. Therefore, the two researchers relied on an analysis of the extent to which the indicators correspond to the stage of inputs into the e-governance system, to improve the quality of services strategy. The two researchers believe that the indicators are the most identical in the input stage of the e-governance system with the indicators approved in the study. The reliability in the input stage was represented by the data sources approved in the e-governance system, which relied on the Central Statistics Authority for their availability.

In turn, the Central Bureau of Statistics collects both quantitative and descriptive data and analyzes them according to modern and advanced programs such as SPSS. As for the response indicator, the two researchers find it compatible with the input stage due to the ability of the system, at this stage, to provide accurate data according to the need of the relevant authorities and the speed required for all stages.

Operations in line with the nature of the system's work and the institution. As for the focus indicator on the beneficiary's need, the system focused on achieving the objectives of the Ministry of Health, which are to reduce maternal and child mortality under the age of five as the beneficiary of the e-governance system. These objectives were adopted as indicators to achieve quality of service.

The conformity index also corresponds to the stage of inputs into the system by relying on the Central Statistical Organization to collect data and analyze it according to international standards, classifications and specifications to achieve quality and conformity with international and local laws and regulations.

The communication index corresponds to the input stage in order to adopt the system on the Intranet and the Internet to enable communication between the concerned authorities and the beneficiaries of the system, which helps to speed communication and data transfer and to make compromise and realistic decisions.

The e-governance system was designed using the Oracle software, which is defined by its high ability to protect information. In the input phase, a special portal for users was designed according to a special code in order to provide protection for all data from tampering. To achieve quality in the system, the principle of quality management (continuous improvement) was adopted in all stages of the system in order to ensure keeping pace with the developments in information technology and training workers on the latest developments in information and communication technology.

2. The operations stage.

The operations consist of four stages ; determining the actual need, financial allocations, feasibility studies, and finally the needs determination stage. The present study relied on the inclusion of quality in all stages of operations in the e-governance system.

The reliability dimension coincides with the operations stage in the e-governance system in the two stages of needs determination and the stage of distributing financial allocations. The indicator is to identify the needs of the administrative units of health institutions represented in the percentage of population projections, the poverty line ratio, the maternal mortality ratio, the child mortality rate to find quick solutions reducing the size of the damages caused by the shortage in the number of health institutions by providing the infrastructure in the areas most in need of these institutions and working to reduce the gap between the actual number and what is supposed to be provided. The indicator of the beneficiary needs in the operations stage focuses on the actual needs of stakeholders and arranges them according to the priorities of the indicators adopted in both stages; projections of the population, the proportion of the poverty line, the proportion of maternal mortality, and child mortality. It also included the stage of identifying the priorities of implementation of stakeholder participation. The dimension of matching is identical at all stages of operations where standards and indicators are set in line with the achievement of quality in the system, such as indicators for identifying the actual needs of the institutions that the research relied on according to locally approved standards and conforming to Arab and international standards, identifying indicators for setting priorities for the distribution of financial allocations referred to above As well as indicators of strengths and weaknesses, opportunities and threats for each project to achieve quality in feasibility studies. Indicators of implementation priorities referred to above are also identical.

As for the behavior dimension, it was identical at all stages of operations in the e-governance system. It relied on specific criteria and indicators, which contribute, to a large extent, to preventing interventions and exerting pressure on the concerned employees. In addition, the e-governance system provides oversight process at all stages of operations in an easier, faster, and more accurate way than paper processes.

The communication index also corresponds to all stages of operations because the system relied on intranet and internet technology to secure communication and transfer of data and information to all relevant agencies. The information security

index corresponds to all stages of operations due to the advantage of the information security system adopted by Oracle in the e-governance system, using electronic portals and a code for each stage of operations. The spatial index of projects for the institutions of the Ministry of Health gives justice and equality in providing health services according to their spatial need. This indicator is matched at the stage of determining the needs of health institutions through the adoption of planning standards approved in the strategic plans of the Ministry of Health and controls for establishing health institutions in the Ministry of Health.

The continuous improvement of the e-governance system ensures that it keeps abreast of the developments in information and communication technology. It also enables working staff to develop their skills by entering training courses and encouraging them to be strategic leaders. The index has matched throughout all stages of operations. The e-governance system also made it possible for beneficiaries to participate in setting priorities for implementing health institutions projects through the online portal by setting a percentage of beneficiaries' participation from the total percentages of indicators for setting priorities for implementation to be combined with other indicators at that stage to define priorities for project implementation in the administrative unit.

The system also included achieving the objectives of the strategic plans of government institutions and the Ministry of Health, which is to reduce the poverty line percentage and reduce the percentage of maternal deaths and deaths of children under the age of five to adopt these objectives as indicators to determine the priorities for the distribution of financial allocations and the priorities for implementing projects.

3- The Outputs stage.

Outputs are the final outcome of what has been applied to the data in order to prepare the strategic plan to improve the quality of services.

that the indicators that are most closely related to the output stage of the e-governance system with the indicators approved in the study represent the system's consistency in the output stage with the indicators of reliability and sympathy to achieve the desires and needs of beneficiaries through setting a strategic plan according to specific priorities and time-bound to achieve in light of the e-governance system. In addition to the services provided by the online portal for users, it enables them to communicate and interact with decision makers. This contributes to making decisions that are closer to reality and more capable of implementation. GIS technology also provides a set of services through which users can obtain answers to their questions and inquiries about future plans of the Ministry of Health to identify projects sites and the costs and priorities of their implementation. The user also seeks the efficiency of the service provided by employing the material and human capabilities in order to provide satisfying services through the electronic portal and the GIS system in addition to reducing the time and effort spent on preparing strategic plans in line with the tangibility index.

The two researchers are keen to include the dimensions of the quality of electronic services with the output stage, including the information security, ease of use, and equal access to information for all users in accordance with the principles of disseminating information, regulations and applicable laws. The interaction between the user and government institutions and participation in determining priorities also helps in strengthening the relationship between those institutions and citizens and strengthening the reputation of government institutions.

Disseminating information and documenting it on websites enhances the principle of transparency and integrity in the work of government institutions and facilitates the work of regulatory institutions and citizens by identifying the nature of the work of these institutions. This corresponds to the standards of behavior with the stage of outputs.

The use of information and communications technology achieves a number of advantages of the system, including ease of communication and information transfer between the relevant authorities in preparing plans and enabling the citizen to interact with government institutions easily. The use of the Oracle security system has also provided a high security for the information because of its high protection and security of data.

The use of indicators in the operations stage contributed greatly to achieving equitable spatial distribution of projects for health institutions. It also ensures the continuous improvement of the e-governance system to keep abreast of developments in information and communication technology, and enables working staff to develop their skills by entering training courses and encouraging them to be strategic leaders.

The interaction between governmental institutions themselves, governmental institutions, business units, governmental institutions and citizens in the outputs stage also achieves the third level of e-governance levels. In this way, the system includes the participation of all parties and stakeholders in providing services.

The successful implementation of the strategic plan extracted from the operations stage ensures the achievement of the objectives of the strategic plans of these institutions; reducing poverty and reducing maternal and child mortality under the age of five.

4. Feedback.

The dimension of response in the stage of feedback is to identify the obstacles of implementing the planned projects to overcome them. It also represented the tangible dimension in the use of information and communications technology and reliance on tablets (Tab) in collecting data from its source, auditing and processing it according to data collection controls and standards. The use of information technology facilitates the supervision of the data collection process and achieves its security and keeps it from tampering or damage when done on paper. It also facilitates the process of transferring data via the Internet to the concerned authorities in a more efficient and effective manner.

It requires the use of information and communications technology to keep pace with modernity in this field and to train workers in the stage of feedback on the use of the latest methods of collecting information. The opinion of the beneficiaries is very important to determine the size of the gap between the user's perception of the service and their expectations regarding it. Therefore, the beneficiaries' participation is the most important indicator at this stage.

In light of what has been presented, the two researchers believe that most of the indicators that are compatible with the system are concentrated in the output stage, which confirms the quality of the e-governance system as a summary of what has been accomplished from all the data according to the indicators applied within the system. It is followed by the stage of operations, the input stage, and the feedback. Table (3) Shows the most closely related quality indicators in the e-governance system.

Table (3) the most closely related quality indicators in the e-governance system

No.	The indicator	Input stage	Stage of operations	Output stage	Feedback	Total
1.	Reliability	√	√	√	×	3
2.	Response	√	×	×	√	2
3.	Sympathy	×	×	√	×	1
4.	Tangibility	×	×	√	√	2
5.	Focus on the beneficiary	√	√	×	×	2
6.	reputation	×	×	√	×	1
7.	Matching	√	√	√	√	4
8.	Standards of behavior	×	√	√	×	2
9.	Communication	√	√	√	√	4
10.	Information Security	√	√	√	√	4
11.	Spatial distribution	×	√	√	×	2
12.	continuous improvement	√	√	√	√	4
13.	Participation of beneficiaries	×	√	√	√	3

14.	Reducing poverty	×	√	√	×	2
15.	Reducing maternal mortality rates	×	√	√	×	2
16.	Reducing child mortality rates below 5	×	√	√	×	2

Source; The two researchers

V. CONCLUSIONS

1. The inclusion of quality in the corporate governance system of the respondent achieves success in implementing the electronic governance system. This was confirmed by the participants in the official interviews.
2. The continuous improvement and keeping pace with developments in information and communication technologies has an important impact in continuing to achieve success in the implementation of the e-governance system.
3. Political interventions weaken the successful implementation of the e-governance system.
4. The weak knowledge capabilities of the higher leaders may lead them to work to prevent the successful implementation of the e-governance system.
5. Conformity, communication, information security and continuous improvement indicators are among the most closely aligned with the stages of the e-governance system.
6. Improving the quality of the e-governance system requires not only the quality management indicators presented, but also the specificity and nature of the work of the Ministry of Health, requires that other indicators that contribute to quality improvement, such as spatial distribution, be taken into consideration.

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Working to keep pace with developments in the field of information and communication technologies and focusing on training workers on the latest programs.
2. Focusing on the corresponding indicators, communication, information security and continuous improvement, as they are the most identical indicators for achieving quality in the e-governance system.
3. Educating senior leaders on the importance of information and communication technology and raising the level of their electronic skills.
4. Focusing on the need of the beneficiary, as it represents the main pillar in achieving quality of service.
5. Including the indicators mentioned in the study to achieve the quality of service, as it corresponds to all stages of the e-governance system, through the reasons indicated at each stage of the system design for each indicator separately.

REFERENCES

1. ARY, DONALD; JACOBS, LUCY CHESER AND SORESENSEN CHRIS,2011, *Introduction to Research in Education*, Wadsworth 10 Davis Drive Belmont, CA 94002-3098 USA.
2. PATEL, ADARSH SURYAKANT; VORA , BHRANTAV NISHENDUBHAI AND PATEL PRAVINKUMAR RAMESHBHAI,2012, "Importance of E-Governance in India and Challenges to implement", International Journal of Computer Science And Technology, ISSN : 0976-8491 (Online) | ISSN : 2229-4333 (Print) IJCST Vol. 3, Issue 2, April - June 2012 :1.
3. Ming, Anthony; Awan Omer and Naveed Somani,2013, e-Governance in Small States, Commonwealth Secretariat Marlborough House Pall Mall London SW1Y 5HX United:1
4. Suri P.K. and Sushil,2017," Strategic Planning and Implementation of E-Governance" Library of Congress Control © Springer Science+Business Media Singapore :5
5. David, Adejuwon Kehinde, 2018," FROM E-GOVERNMENT TO E-GOVERNANCE: WHITHER AFRICAN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION", Science Education Development Institute, Volume 2 (1) Jan: 63 – 75
6. Crosby , By Philip B. , 1980, QUALITY IS FREE The Art of Making Quality Certain, the Penguin Group Penguin Books USA Inc., 375 Hudson Street, New York, New York 10014, U.S.A.
7. Chandrupatla , Tirupathi R. ,2009, Quality and Reliability in Engineering, Cambridge University Press; 1 edition (January 12, 2009)p 2
8. Parasuraman, Zeithaml Valerie A, and Leonard, Berr L,1985, A Conceptual Model of Service Quality and Its Implications for Future Research, Journal of Marketing Vol. 49 (Fall 1985), 41-50.
9. Lewis, Barbara R and Mitchell Vincent W, 2006, Defining and Measuring the Quality of Customer Service, Downloaded by City, University of London At 02:03 05 January p13.

10. Loke, Siew-Phaik; Taiwo, Ayankunle Adegbite; Salim Hanisah Mat and Alan, Downe G, 2011, Service Quality and Customer Satisfaction in a Telecommunication Service Provider, International Conference on Financial Management and Economics IPEDR vol.11) IACSIT Press, Singapore.
11. Jeyalakshmi Santhana and Meenakumari, 2016, SERVICE QUALITY MANAGEMENT: A LITERATURE REVIEW, Shanlax International Journal of Management, Volume 3 Issue 4 April 2016 ISSN: 2321 – 4643.
12. Fleissy, L., (2012) The reality of the quality of services in organizations and their role in achieving outstanding performance, case study of the Faculty of Economic Sciences, Trade and Facilitation Sciences, University of Mohamed Bougherra Boumerdes, thesis for a master's degree in economic sciences / organization facilitation, published
13. Al-Darrakah, M., (2001): Total Quality Management and Customer Service, Amman: Dar Al-Safaa, second edition
14. Zeithaml, Valarie A. 2000, Service Quality, Profitability, and the Economic Worth of Customers: What We Know and What We Need to Learn, Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science. Volume 28, No. 1, pages 67-85. Copyright 9 2000 by Academy of Marketing Science.
15. Berry, Leonard; A. Parasuraman, and . Zeithaml, Valarie, 1994, A Improving service quality in America: Lessons learned, Academy of Management Executive, 1994 Vol. 8 No.
16. Laxmikumari; vijay kumar and V. Ramana, Venkata 2014, TQM: A Quality and Performance Enhancer, International Journal of Engineering And Science Vol.4, Issue 8 (August 2014), PP 91-94, Issn (e): 2278-4721, Issn (p): 2319-6483, www.researchinventy.com.
17. Ramy; A Kowsaly and Dharanipriy, 2019, SERVICE QUALITY AND ITS DIMENSIONS, Research & Development EPRA International Journal of (IJRD) Monthly Peer Reviewed & Indexed International Online Journal 2455-7838 SJIF Impact Factor : 6.093.
18. Mehmood, Shahid, Qadeer, Faisal and Ahmad Aftab, 2014, Relationship between TQM Dimensions and Organizational Performance, Pak J Commer Soc Sci Pakistan Journal of Commerce and Social Sciences 2014, Vol. 8 (3), 662-679.
19. Savic, Dobrica, 2006, E-GOVERNANCE Theoretical foundations and practical implication p30 <http://www.dobrica.savic.ca/>
20. Samat, Nusrah, Ramayah T. and Mat Saad, Norizan 2006, TQM practices, service quality, and market orientation Some empirical evidence from a developing country, Management Research News Vol. 29 No. 11, 2006 pp. 713-728 # Emerald Group Publishing Limited 0140-9174.
21. Ministry of Planning, 2018, Poverty Reduction Strategy 2018-2022, Central Statistical Organization Press, Ministry of Planning, 2018 Sustainable Development Strategy 2018-2022, Central Statistical Organization Press.
22. Ministry of Health, 2019, statistical report for the year 2018.