

A Review on the Successful Factors of Contributing to Graduate on Time (Got) Among PHD Holders

Intan Maizura Abd Rashid, Wan Ahmad Fauzi Wan Husain,
Irza Hanie Abu Samah and Mohammad Harith Amlus

***Abstract---** This study is important so as to identify the successful factors for PhD students to graduate on time (GOT). However, the research will be carried out based on the PhD students in Malaysia where it will cover in all university in Malaysia. This study used data collection method included administering questionnaires were distributed to randomly selected students. A total number of 200 questionnaires were distributes according different gender, age, race and year of study to survey the successful factors for PhD students to graduate on time. The finding of this research will help the PhD students to understand further on factors and strategies for graduate on time during their PhD program. This study is particularly useful for PhD students to find out the behavior of young adults especially in Perlis. The scope of this research covers the successful factors for PhD students to graduate on time. This study also particularly useful for PhD students to have continuous improvement in their study. Besides that, PhD students can gain more ideas or suggestion on how to improve their study that can satisfy themselves and stay committed to their study.*

***Keywords---** Graduate on Time (GOT), Personal Factors, Institutional Factors, Supervisor's Support.*

I. INTRODUCTION

At an essential dimension it is likewise noticed that frequent supervision is firmly connected with successful completion (Woodward, 1993). The characteristics of good supervisors can be describe as easy to approach, friendly, supportive, have positive attitude, open minded, prepared to acknowledge error, organized, thorough, stimulating, conveys enthusiasm for research (Delany, 2013). Bourke et al. (2004) also agreed that the most important factors which is relationship with faculty adviser can lead to completion on time. Further, studies also found that supporting physical assets and infrastructure incorporates vehicle parks, lecture halls, office space and library administrations man additionally add to the timely completion of the students (Pitchforth, Beames, Thomas, Falk, Gasson, Thamrin & Mengersen, 2012).

Library administrations are imperative to improve PhD understudy's involvement. This can be referred to computer access, ease entry to the library when required, access to electronic library resources, remote access to the library lists, intercampus books and materials' conveyance administrations, library staff help and interlibrary advance administrations (Grebennikov & Shah, 2007; Pitchforth et al., 2012). Kluever (1995) also stated that doctoral student reflect an institution's insightful nature, but they also additionally expend a greater amount of its

*Intan Maizura Abd Rashid, School of Business Innovation & Technopreneurship, Universiti Malaysia Perlis, Malaysia.
E-mail: intanmaizura@unimap.edu.my*

Wan Ahmad Fauzi Wan Husain, School of Business Innovation & Technopreneurship, Universiti Malaysia Perlis, Malaysia.

Irza Hanie Abu Samah, School of Business Innovation & Technopreneurship, Universiti Malaysia Perlis, Malaysia.

Mohammad Harith Amlus, School of Business Innovation & Technopreneurship, Universiti Malaysia Perlis, Malaysia.

assets, for example, faculty time, skill, and vitality; library offices; and computer administrations. The target time for PhD students to complete their study changes appropriately. For most PhD programs the usually target time to finish the studies was five years and to be complete in three years is rarely among the students (Stock et al., 2009). Five years target time for PhD fulfillment is predictable with Wamala, Ocaya and Oonyu (2012) who utilized five years as a benchmark for PhD fulfillment in their study.

Numerous investigations investigating the components impact either the applicant's finish or steady loss of their examination demonstrated a few factors that impact understudy perseverance in doctoral instruction in couple of explicit regions which is supervisor's help, financial aid, mentoring and socialization, research productivity, health and wellness (Bourke, Holbrook, Lovat & Farley, 2004; Carter, 2008, Latona & Browne, 2001; Rodwell & Neumann, 2005). Different researches on PhD completion likewise propose that inside an order the nature of supervision is the key factor deciding the successful and timely completion of a PhD (Dinham & Scott, 1998; Knowles, 1999; Seagram, Gould & Pyke, 1998).

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

Supervisor's Support

Supervisor's support is one of the key component distinguished to urge student to graduate on schedule. Support was featured by as one of the essential factor for students to be successful and persevere. The support can distinguished as the information and guidance given by the supervisor to guarantee student's smooth execution all through the predetermined study duration. The role of supervisor has likewise been analyzed by different authors such as Zhao (2007). A Procrastination Inventory proposed by Muszynski and Akamatsu (1991) revealed that demographic and situational factors including a supportive guide, finding a point of enthusiasm, making the dissertation a top need and living near the college were prescient of progress, however that particular research interests or proportions of necessities or qualities were not huge indicators.

Nathan (2005) stated that student accomplishment to be in the way in which the supervisor and the student impart which one another. As such, Nathan advocates that the connection between the two can be harmonious in nature which is making an individual relationship that puts a human point of view on the essence of the communication among supervisor and student so as to advance accomplishment for the student. Bain (2004) believes student achievement comes likewise from the supervisor imparting to the student that they care about that student, as they have an interest in them as student, yet additionally as human being. This venture shows to the student that supervisor need the student to succeed and will do everything conceivable to help in that achievement, yet the student likewise needs to choose on the off chance that they need to succeed, as it is a two sided condition of accomplishment. This idea leads into one more comparative route to success for the student where the supervisor aids the assistance of student believing in their own prosperity. According to Johnson (2005), what professor convey to the study hall is similarly as basic as what the students bring into the homeroom. "When we trust that student can succeed, they succeed. Your conviction alone isn't sufficient; you should enable your student to trust that achievement is conceivable. At the point when student trust that they can succeed, they attempt and they learn". Another researcher which is Jinarek (2010) revealed that supervisory and insightful environment are one of the

variables that contribute to auspicious PhD completion. Having perceived the potential significance of graduate attributes, in any case it is obvious from the surviving writing that surveying their role alone is deficient.

There is clear proof now that, when student begins their PhD studies, student are frequently misty about what they should do (Pole et al. 1997), furthermore a divergence exists among student and supervisor conceptions of research (Bills 2004; Kiley and Mullins 2005; Meyer, Shanahan, and Laugksch 2005). Along these lines, presently a wide agreement in the writing that appropriate supervisor support all through PhD studies is essential (e.g. Frischer and Larsson 2000; Gurr 2001; Pearson and Brew 2002), with observational proof exhibiting the estimation of such help to PhD achievement (Sinclair, 2004). This exact proof additionally recommends that, in spite of the fact that not really formally educated in a classroom setting, the advancement of graduate ascribes is probably going to be upgraded through more elevated amounts of supervisor's support, for example, helping student create relevant skills and knowledge (Sinclair, 2004). It is along these lines that the positive results got from the advancement of graduate attributes might be observed just under states of generally high supervisor support. A secondary objective in the present article was to look at the independent and directing role of apparent dimensions of supervisor help on the different result measures as of now utilized.

Bourke (2004) state that issue with supervision is the reason most every now and again referenced for non-completion of PhD that. Issue that related to the supervision is the reason most every now and again referenced for non-completion of PhD. At a basic level it is also noticed that progressively supervision is firmly connected with successful completion (Woodward, 1993). Based on Delany (2013), the attributes of good supervisor are receptive, well disposed, strong, have inspirational demeanor, liberal, arranged to recognize mistake, sorted out, careful, invigorating, passes on energy for research. A decent supervisor will play his or her job as a director, facilitator, counsel, educator, guide, commentator and opportunity giver.

Institutional Factors

Institutional/organizational alludes to supporting physical resources and infrastructure referred to vehicle parks, lecture halls, office space and library administrations (Pitchforth, Beames, Thomas, Falk, Farr, Gasson, Thomprin & Mengersen, 2012; Stock et al., 2009). It is essential to encourage students with office space as PhD candidates with office space are bound to finish their PhD prior contrasted with those without office space (Stock et al., 2009). Library administrations are critical to upgrade PhD student's understanding. This consists of computer get right of entry to, ease of get admission to the library while needed, access to electronic library sources, remote access to the library catalogues, intercampus books and materials' delivery offerings, library group of workers assistance and interlibrary mortgage services (Grebennikov & Shah, 2007; Pitchforth et al., 2012). Institutional need to offer strong medicinal program to address scholarly ineptness of new students particularly those in proposal based program. It is useful to the candidates when the institutional direct some workshops on structuring study, information gathering, data analysis and scholarly composition. Off grounds support and directing occasions that gives a road to systems administration with other research students and college explore focuses will likewise help students all through their candidature (Grebennikov & Shah, 2007).

Personal Factors

Personal factors are what are alluded to in the writing as foundation attributes or pre-school factors. These individual components are valuable in seeing how students acclimate to institution (Hurtado, 2000). Personal factors include goals and commitment, finances, and academic self-concept.

a) Goals and Commitment

Getting a doctorate requires intensive work. The best student have an enthusiasm for the subject and appreciate the way toward getting familiar with it, basically getting to be submerged in the point. Student with uplifting viewpoints of their prospects and the results of the doctoral program are bound to accomplish their objectives. Practically 50% of the supervisor referenced commitment which is to pick up learning, to finish work or to do well is one of the way to successful study completion. Other expressions illustrating commitment were perseverance, persistence, determination, dedication, tenacity, resilience and endurance. There are other influencing factors such as self-efficacy, determination and commitment and intention to succeed and handle failure (Glogowska et al., 2007). Self-efficacy is a significant factor in student accomplishment as it identifies with their conviction of having the option to accomplish their targets. This may identify with assurance, for example the quality with which the student needs to continue, notwithstanding when things are extreme. Student with a solid assurance are focused on completing the education and are progressively arranged to manage disappointment. As stated, Tinto (1993) also identified aim and commitment as primary factors for students take off at the individual dimension. Researchers at Johnson & Wales University and the International Journal of Doctoral Studies found that a craving for a superior life to be one of the key inspiration and a contributing components to success. Absence of responsibility and absence of preparation were distinguished in the HEFCE report (1997) as factors prompting non-completion, particularly for the customary students matured 18-21 on passage also. Absence of responsibility is respected in this report to be because of parental or companion bunch weight for entering advanced education as opposed to the individual need to get a degree.

On the other hand, Lubben et al. (2010) found for their situation ponder that parental or peer weight was scarcely referenced as an explanation behind picking a specific course. Prymachuk et al. (2009) researched at a huge English college into student's dropout in nursing instruction. They recognized that a higher age on passage prompts higher completion rates. Students with a higher age at passage were observed to be more dedicated than more youthful students, which is steady with the discoveries of the HEFCE report (1997). As indicated by Kearns, Gardiner and Marshall (2008), self-debilitating conduct makes PhD such a troublesome procedure and keeps applicants from completing on schedule. Self-debilitating conduct or self-damage can be characterized as the way toward making snags to your objectives for thinking whether disappointment happens. The procedure could be genuine or envisioned. Self-incapacitating conduct usually shown by PhD students are overcommitting, being hectic, hairsplitting, lingering, confusion, not investing exertion, and picking execution crippling conditions. Overcommitting can be depicted as taking on such a significant number of things, for example, low maintenance work or different duties that completing PhD, the high need objectives endure. Being hectic alludes to looking

caught up with getting less significant things, for example going to numerous classes done yet barely possesses the energy for progressively significant assignments, for example, composing a draft of the main part.

b) Student's Financial

Wao and Onwuegbuzie (2011) discussed the significance of economic integration which is "how much student's money related requirements are met while seeking the doctorate". Financial combination is fundamental given research proposing that regardless of program, student who self-finance their studies are more averse to continue (Earl-Novell, 2006). College supported associations and assistantships impact monetary mix and increment constancy and reduction time-to-degree rates (Earl-Novell, 2006; Wao & Onwuegbuzie, 2011). Lovitts (2001) found that 20% of students in her investigation referred to financial related purposes behind their program departure. Lovitts (2001) found that 20% of students in her study cited financial reasons for their program departure financial help is fundamental to the enlistment and maintenance of students from low-salary background in advanced education (Nora, 2001). Proof gathered over the previous decade shows that financial guide impacts student diligence, particularly among the financially hindered (Tinto, 1994). The issue of financing a college education and its effect on Hispanic student' maintenance is basic when one thinks about the national pattern of expanded student educational cost while diminishing financial guide programs. Student's mode of study is much of the time identified with financial related help. The full-time students more often did not get financial related help and don't have major financial stresses. Comparable with mode of study, the impact of scholarship or financial related help on PhD student's consummation or attrition stays unsure. Bourke et al. (2004) found that candidates who held a grant have shorter candidature. This is predictable with Stock et al. (2009), yet just among US natives, and not non US residents. Conversely, Wamala et al. (2012) found that in Makerere, Africa student with grant or financial related help are bound to stretch out their candidature to over five years.

c) Student's Academic

Admission to the country's schools and colleges keeps on depending on conventional estimations, for example, secondary school grade point normal and scores on school selection tests. School achievement is frequently anticipated dependent on how well a student has performed in secondary school. Lesure-Lester (2003) composed there is proof that shows test scores may not anticipate early school grades for Hispanic understudies.

Furthermore, test scores, for example, SAT scores did not foresee school GPAs, time to completion of degree, or probability of applying to graduate school. Nora (2001) state that scholarly self-idea was essentially identified with GPA and that Mexican American students with a similar scholastic background were bound to accomplish higher evaluations in the event that they had more prominent trust in their scholarly capacities. Hernandez (2000) detailed that successful students who exhibited a positive mental standpoint, credited this as the absolute most significant factor that impacted their retention in college.

Hypotheses Statements

Three hypotheses have been developed for this student based on dependent and independent variables at below:-

H1: There is a significant relationship between supervisor's support and PhD students graduate on time (GOT).

H2: There is a significant relationship between institutional factors and PhD students graduate on time (GOT).

H3: There is a significant relationship between personal factors and PhD students graduate on time (GOT).

Based on the hypotheses, the research framework is focused on the four independent variables and PhD students graduate on time (GOT) is dependent variable. Those factors focusing on supervisor's support, institutional factors and personal factors should have a positive relationship in relation to successful factors for PhD students in Malaysia to graduate on time (GOT).

Sampling

In this research, respondents were randomly selected in any states in Malaysia. The questionnaires were distributed at Universiti Malaysia Perlis (UniMAP), Universiti Teknologi Mara Perlis (UiTM), Universiti Utara Malaysia (UUM) and others. Questionnaires also distributed through survey builder website and electronic device. In order to obtain reliable results, there are 370 questionnaires were distributed randomly. Besides that, questionnaires distributed to those PhD students in Malaysia that already finish their studies and also distributed to those PhD students that still on going with their studies.

Sample Size

In order to obtain reliable results and achieve objectives of study, there were 205 sets of questionnaires distributed randomly in any universities in Malaysia. Respondents were of legal age 20 and above.

Questionnaires

Questionnaires are the most method used widely by people or organizations in order to gather information. In the questionnaire, a list of questions and answer were asked to the respondents. All the questions were the same for all the respondents. Through the questionnaire, respondents have the opportunity to answer without coercion and based on their own opinion. Sekaran (2003) stated that questionnaires are an efficient data collection mechanism because the researcher will know exactly what is required and how to measure the variable of interest. The researcher gave the questionnaires to a group of people. The researcher also allotted the respondents a certain time to respond to the questions. This method was used by most researchers in order to get a clear picture about the study. The questionnaire consists of three sections which are section A, section B, and section C and section D.

Section A is about the demographic profile. There were questions about the respondent's profile such as gender, age, ethnicity, mode of study, occupations, area of study, duration of study, marital status, nationality and funding of tuition fees. The purpose of these questions is to reveal the correlation of the demographic profiling. Section B, section C and section D includes the questions related to variables, independent and dependent variables. In this section, questions were answered using a five-point Likert scale. The scales used are range between 1 to 5:

- 1 - Strongly disagree
- 2 - Disagree
- 3 - Neutral
- 4 - Agree
- 5 - Strongly agree

Likert scale was used in this research to generate statistical measurements of successful factors for PhD students in Malaysia to graduate on time (GOT). Keegan (2009) found that Rensis Likert developed the Likert scale to measure the attitudes.

Summary of Questionnaires.

Section A: Demographic

Section B: Successful Factors for PhD Students in Malaysia to Graduate on Time (Supervisor's Support)

Section C: Successful Factors for PhD Students in Malaysia to Graduate on Time (Institutional Factors)

Section D: Successful Factors for PhD Students in Malaysia to Graduate on Time (Personal Factors)

Statistical Model

The statistical model discusses the findings, analysis, and interpretation of the data collected. The data were analyzed using SPSS software version 22.0. Results of the finding were discussed in detail in Chapter Four. After the questionnaires were developed, distributed, and received back from respondents, the data analysis started. SPSS Version 22.0 is commonly used to interpret all data are obtained. Reliability, and frequency distribution are based on demographic and descriptive analysis also been use at this next chapter.

Reliability Analysis

Reliability analysis is used to determine data's consistency and stability. Reliability test analysis refers to the degree to which a test is consistent and stable in measuring what is intended to be measured (Cavana et al., 2001). Consistency indicates how well the items measuring a concept hang together as a set. The reliability analysis was done by using Cronbach's Alpha Technique. When the correlations between items increasing, the Cronbach's Alpha generally increasing as well. The value of alpha, 0.5 and above will be considered reliable and accepted in the research.

Descriptive Analysis

This is the stage where all the segments of VQ, IQ, SE, SI, EE, PE and use usage were analyzed. With this, researcher was able to evaluate and understand each segment related to successful factors for PhD students in Malaysia to graduate on time (GOT). In research, hypotheses test can also be analysed by using F-Test in order to investigate each hypotheses.

Independent variables and dependent variables were compared by using T-test and one-way ANOVA. Results were used to determine the comparison of demographic characteristic such as gender, age, ethnicity, mode of study, occupations, area of study, duration of study, marital status, nationality and funding of tuition fees with VQ, IQ, S, SE, SI, EE, and PE. Hypotheses Test with correlation was also made to reveal correlation of variables to each other.

Frequency Distribution

Frequency distribution refers to how frequently something was identified. Before developing frequency distribution, it is imperative to get picture about the overall demographic from the respondents. Profile and characteristic of respondents were very important in determining the successful factors for PhD students in Malaysia

to graduate on time (GOT). The demographic profile of respondents includes gender, age, ethnicity, mode of study, occupations, area of study, duration of study, marital status, nationality and funding of tuition fees.

Correlation Analysis

Correlation analysis is known as a method of statistical evaluation that usually used to determine the strength of a relationship between two numerically measured that continuous variables such as weight and height. This correlation analysis also used to find whether there are possible connections between variables. If two variables was found to be correlate between both of them, it can be conclude that there is a systematic change in one variable and also can be conclude that there is also a systematic change in the other where the variables alter together over a certain period of time. The correlation analysis can be either positive or negative depending upon the numerical values measured.

Regression Analysis

Regression analysis can be determine as a reliable method of identifying which variables have impact on a topic of interest. The process of conducting regression analysis allows researchers to confidently determine which factors matter most, which factors can be ignored, and how these factors influence each other. The dependent variable that conducted in this analysis is the main factor that to be understand or predict while that independent variable in the regression analysis is the factors that will be hypothesize have an impact on the dependent variable. Regression analysis will conclude as significant if the value of significant is below than 0.05.

Pilot Test

Pilot test was run after finishing the questionnaires. While running this test, 30 respondents were selected to fill up and answer the questionnaires. The purpose of this test is to explore the understanding of respondents towards each item in the questionnaire. Through the pilot test, the weakness in designing and instrumentation of questionnaires can be detected and modified or deleted before distributed to the large sample of respondents. These questionnaires were distributed randomly to users in Malaysia. Cronbach's Alpha Method also used to test the reliability of data.

III. IMPLICATIONS

The auspicious completion of PhD program necessitates that all parties should play fully their role. Along these lines, in the extent supervision is concerned, this study researched likewise the issue around time and content for example consistency and significance of feedback from supervisors and the degree to which it influences the timely completion of PhD program. The analysis of the information in this segment on input from supervisors indicates two major components that all may effect on timely completion of the PhD program. The first is the way that tending to remarks from supervisors requires some times. Thus, if supervisors would give feedback on time, it would spare time for the student's advancement particularly for international students whose stay abroad is complied with special financial, work contract and legitimate conditions. The second is the truth that a few supervisors give less thoughtfulness regarding supervisee's work. As suggestions, these supervisors neglect to ace the supervisee's work

and end up by giving unessential, conflicting or unsubstantial comments. The discoveries of this study showed that the supervisor and supervisee relationship is determinant towards timely completion of PhD program.

Some of students thought that it was simpler to approach their supervisor while others were completely befuddled with respect to the procedures to embrace when it went to an opportunity to approach the supervisor. The result of the current study also showed that it was important for institutional provides supporting physical resources and infrastructure in order to represents relaxation and enjoyment in completing the PhD program and ease the PhD student to do their research. The current study also showed that personal factors that include goals and commitment, finances, and academic self-concept played important role for PhD students to graduate in time (GOT).

IV. CONCLUSION

The study has explored the Malaysian IPTA PhD candidate's perceptions on factors contributing to the timely completion of their study. The case refers to PhD candidates of UUM covering three major postgraduate schools namely OYA COB, Awang Had Salleh Graduate School CAS and GSGSG COLGIS. Three factors are found to be significantly contributed to the timely completion of PhD among the PhD candidates in Malaysia. Supervisor's support factor derives as the most contributing factor, follows with the institutional factor and personal factors. Additionally, research work is found to have a contribution to the timely completion of PhD among the PhD candidates in Malaysia. The findings explicitly would help the postgraduate schools in effectively arranging and dealing with their PhD candidates later on. University administrators and chief scholastic officers should invest impressive energy, exertion, and assets examining non-scholarly factors identified with student takeoff from the university, for example, (a) integration with the community, (b) financial related guide versus scholarship support, (c) lodging issues, (d) dismissal of family and companions, (e) self-assurance, and (f) presence (or non-presence) of good examples and tutors. Retention is intricate and multidimensional and stretches out a long ways past the scholarly capabilities of entering freshmen. Information must be further disaggregated to analyze a greater amount of the individual and socio-cultural issues that impact student retention.

Limitation of Study

The present investigation has its limitation in light of the fact that the consequence of the finding might be one-sided, as the information got may not be a complete representative of progress that happens in Malaysia. The sample was limited to selected PhD students and staffs among universities in Malaysia. What's more, to those respondents may not be a genuine portrayal of the student setting all in all since the study depended on just 375 respondents. In any case, it ought to be underlined that the bigger the example estimate, the more representative results from the analysis. In addition, time imperative was another restriction of the present study. What's more, the surveys were appropriated haphazardly and the analyst didn't know that if the respondents have any involvement in PhD studies. The example sizes of the respondents were constrained to the PhD students only, which have an impact on both the factual analysis just as the discoveries dependent on the analyses, notwithstanding measurable measures to counter these impacts. Furthermore, there were only a total of three independent variables selected for the research and this can affect the limitation of the study. Due to limitations on collection of demographic and other information on the student population, this study could not make any observations along this dimension. The present research only

evaluates successful factors for PhD students in Malaysia to graduate on time (GOT). However, the feedbacks and opinions from other parties involving in graduating on time are considered important to gain a better inside of successful factors for PhD students in Malaysia to graduate on time (GOT).

Suggestion for Future Research

Concerning suggestions for future research, every each of the impediments of the present study as expressed above ought to be overcome. It is recommended that for future research, the candidate's qualities ought to be inspected to comprehend the impact of PhD degree consummation. This would incorporate the qualities, for example, age, gender, country of origin and conjugal status as recently led (Bourke et al., 2004; Cobb, 2013). Further, a top to bottom study on inspirational factor ought to likewise be considered in other academic institutions among various countries since it is demonstrated to be a critical factor in adding to the opportune consummation of PhD. Further, a qualitative study concentrating on the frames of mind and practices of both postgraduate candidates and the organization especially the deans ought to be directed to decide the results with respect to factors adding to the auspicious consummation. Because of time constrain, the information gathered may not be extensive. Consequently, additional time ought to be assigned for this research. Other than that, more factors ought to incorporate into the research to give a superior and progressively extensive information for successful factors for PhD students in Malaysia to graduate on time (GOT). Consequently, the criticisms and respondents from such gatherings ought to be taken as an improvement in order to increase more exhaustive information.

REFERENCES

- [1] Abiddin, N. Z., Hassan, A., & Ahmad, A. R. (2009). Research student supervision: An approach to good supervisory practice. *The Open Education Journal*, 2(1).
- [2] Cox, T. M., Brimicombe, J., Wood, D. F., & Peters, D. K. (2012). The Cambridge Bachelor of Medicine (MB)/Doctor of Philosophy (PhD): graduate outcomes of the first MB/PhD programme in the UK. *Clinical medicine*, 12(6), 530.
- [3] Wahab, S. A., Rose, R. C., & Osman, S. I. W. (2012). Defining the concepts of technology and technology transfer: A literature analysis. *International business research*, 5(1), 61-71.
- [4] Bowen, W. G., & Rudenstine, N. L. (2014). In pursuit of the PhD. *Princeton University Press*.
- [5] Boamah, S. A., Read, E. A., & Spence Laschinger, H. K. (2017). Factors influencing new graduate nurse burnout development, job satisfaction and patient care quality: a time-lagged study. *Journal of advanced nursing*, 73(5), 1182-1195.
- [6] Hymer, S. H. (1976). International operations of national firms. *MIT press*.
- [7] Rashid, I. M. A., Samah, I. H. A., Razali, R., Sham, M. F., Karim, N. A., Basri, H. H.,... & Zahari, M. K. (2016). The Importance of Perceived Leadership Elements in Strategic Planning at Public University. *Procedia Economics and Finance*, 39, 422-426.
- [8] Rashid, I. M. A., & Razak, N. A. A. (2016). Determinants of Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) in Agriculture Sector Based on Selected High-income Developing Economies in OIC Countries: An Empirical Study on the Provincial Panel Data by Using Stata, 2003-2012. *Procedia Economics and Finance*, 39, 328-334.
- [9] Arellano, M. and Bond, S. (1991). Some Test of Specification for Panel Data: Monte Carlo Evidence and Application to Employment Equation. *Some Test of Specification for Panel Data: Monte Carlo Evidence and Application to Employment Equation*.

- [10] Posselt, J. R. (2014). Toward inclusive excellence in graduate education: Constructing merit and diversity in PhD admissions. *American Journal of Education*, 120(4), 481-514.
- [11] Smith, C. L., Jarrett, M., & Bierer, S. B. (2013). Integrating clinical medicine into biomedical graduate education to promote translational research: strategies from two new PhD programs. *Academic medicine: journal of the Association of American Medical Colleges*, 88(1).
- [12] Riggs, K. R., Reitman, Z. J., Mielenz, T. J., & Goodman, P. C. (2012). Relationship between time of first publication and subsequent publication success among non-PhD physician-scientists. *Journal of graduate medical education*, 4(2), 196-201.
- [13] Kuipers, J. L. (2011). PhD and EdD degrees for mid-career professionals: Fielding Graduate University. *New directions for adult and continuing education*, 2011(129), 63-73.