

Reinforcing Teachers' Content Knowledge Competence of Civics Education through Implementing the Actual Civic Issues Strategy

¹Hanry Pratama Putra, ²Muchtarom, ³Triyanto, ⁴Winarno

ABSTRACT--The information development in the 21st century has an impact on the fast spread of citizenship issues. The raising problem at the field was the lack of Civic content knowledge competence of the teachers as the learning providers in delivering and managing actual Civic issues that are in accordance with the students' competence needs in the 21st century. Consequently, the learning materials majorly have turned into static and underdeveloped, and even the phenomenon of interpreting issues is arbitrary and left without critical contemplation. This research aims at determining the reinforcing strategy of teachers' content knowledge competence of Civics Education through the choice of actual citizenship issues. The research was conducted on teachers of Civics Education subject at Junior High Schools in the city of Surakarta; this was designed with qualitative research methods. The data collection was carried out through document study, interview, and observation. The data analysis techniques applied data reduction, data presentation, drawing conclusions and verification. This research indicated that reinforcing the teachers' knowledge competence of Civics Education content can be realized through the choice of actual Civic issues as conceptualized into the 4CS skills (Creativity, Critical thinking, Communication, Collaboration) in accordance with the students' competence needs in the 21st century. The actual citizenship enables teachers strengthening their knowledge competence of Civics Education Content.

Key words-- Civic Education; content knowledge competence; actual Civic issues.

I. INTRODUCTION

Actual Civic issues have rapidly been spread throughout 21st century. To cope with such phenomenon, nearly every country has highlighted the concept of high-level thinking, one of which is to critically analyze current issues [26]. A research conducted in Malaysia revealed that both teachers and the university students of Civics Education department should have the ability to facilitate students with thinking concepts in dealing with various possibilities of actual Civic issues developed in the 21st century [10].

Many countries in the world of today suggest that, future teachers are projected to be able to properly master critical thinking concept, one of which is realized through critical ability in analyzing the actual issues [21]. The

¹Postgraduate in Civics Education Department, Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta, Indonesia, hanrypp95@gmail.com.

²Lecturer of Civics Education Department, Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta, Indonesia.

³Lecturers of Civics Education Department, Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta, Indonesia.

⁴Lecturers of Civics Education Department, Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta, Indonesia.

high-level thinking concept training enables students formulate problems resolution through analysis of actual issues; it provides ways for them practicing reasoning for critical thinking oriented at objectively seeking for the truth [11].

As for the remaining problems in the field, Civics Education teachers at the Junior High School level in Surakarta are classified as lack of competence in developing Content knowledge-based Civics Education which provide guidelines for students to analyze the actual citizenship issues. In fact, the availability of easy access to information in the 21st century through the use of the internet has been leading to actual citizenship issues, which made it possible to disseminate quickly and uncontrollably in the lives of students. Conversely, the lacks of students' ability to analyze actual Civic issues mislead students to commit chaotic actions and error, in terms of their concept of thinking. The chaotic concept of thinking afflicted by students can cause harmful actions, especially for themselves or others. Many of researches in a number of countries reveal that most adolescents perceive actual Civic issues as a complex process, mainly on political issues that instead can increase adolescents' acts of extremism [25].

This shows that the demand for the 21st century's educational needs emphasizes effective learning, which realize all the things applicable to the world of adolescents, one of them can be significantly applied through teachers' Civics Education content based-knowledge competence. Bearing in such situation, this research addresses the topic of Reinforcing Teachers' Content knowledge-based Competence of Civics Education through Actual Civic issues summarized in 4Cs Skills (Creativity, Critical Thinking, Communication, and Collaboration) to provide students concept of thinking in accordance with the 21st century students' competence about Civics Education learning material.

II. REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

A. *Content knowledge Competence of Civic Education*

Content knowledge competence of Civics Education is one of the four underlying competencies that Civics Education teachers in Indonesia should be mastered in addition to pedagogical, personality and social competence [3]. The Content knowledge competence of Civics Education concerns the teachers' Civics Education complete mastery about the materials, structure, concepts and scientific mindsets that can sustain the Civics Education learning [7]. The Regulation issued by the Indonesian Minister of National Education No 16 of 2007 [2] concerning the Academic and Standards of Qualification on both Teachers and Lecturers' Competencies stipulated that Content knowledge Competence as follows:

Table 1: The Core Competence of the Professional Civics Education Teacher

No.	Civics Education Subject Core Competence of Indonesian Teachers
-----	---

- | | |
|---|---|
| 1 | Mastering: material, structure, concepts, and scientific mindset which can sustain the subjects being taught. |
|---|---|

2	Having a complete understanding of standard competence of the subjects being taught.
3	Developing creative learning materials to be taught.
4	Developing professionalism on an ongoing basis
5	Using communication technology and information to develop self- capacities.

Source: Regulation issued by the Minister of Indonesian National Education No. 16 of 2007.

The sources adapted into the Content knowledge competence of Civics Education are basically the expanded civics with various other disciplines such as social sciences, humanities, science, technology, arts and culture, in addition to religious values and other sustaining social problems, material, concepts and civic sciences [5]. The quality of Content knowledge competence of Civics Education is quite pivotal to comprehend the underlying Civics Education which covers among others; civic knowledge, civic disposition, and civic skills. The synergy of the three Civics Education substances shall produce a better Civics Education that will ultimately create an excellent citizenship [1].

B. Actual Civic issues

Having a complete understanding towards current issues is quite important. A research conducted in 2018 prove that proper understanding of the related issues are influential to students' worldview and minimize any possible risk for making wrong decisions in solving problems [16]. The Actual Civic issues simply cover the issues related to civic status that enables the citizens' fulfilling the rights and obligations occur at the present or in the recent times. Whereas specifically, the actual Civic issues of Civics Education at schools learning, are the latest issues concerning the Civic matters classifiable into three main issues, among others: (1) scope; (2) contents, and (3) levels. Scope means how broad a country can reach all the citizens without any exclusion practices. Fill in the sense of rights and obligations. Content, in a broader sense, does not only cover formal legality, but the process in addition to political claims through social movements urges the opening of opportunities for citizens to participate in and fulfill legal, political and social rights [17].

C. The C4s Skills Concept

The concept of 21st century learning skills as abbreviated in 4Cs (critical thinking, communication, collaboration, and creativity) can be further extended as four underlying and important skills to address the needs of the 21st century education.

Table 2: The Framework of the 21st Century P21 Skills Competence

The of Framework of the 21st Century P21Thinking Skills	P21 Thinking Skills Competence
--	---

Competence	
<i>Creativity Thinking and innovation</i>	It enables students to produce, develop and implement ideas creatively either independently or within a group.
<i>Critical Thinking and Problem Solving</i>	It enables students to identify, analyze, interpret, and evaluate the evidence, arguments, claims and data which are widely presented through in-depth study, and reflect them in their daily lives.
<i>Communication</i>	It enables students to communicate ideas and ideas effectively verbally, in writing, and in technology.
<i>Collaboration</i>	It enables students to mutually work in groups to solve the indicated problems

Source: Handbook of Learning Oriented to Higher Level Thinking Skills, 2018.

The followings are steps that the learning facilitator can carry out as a learning facilitator through adopting the 4Cs skills exemplified as follows:

Table 3: The 4Cs Skills of Civics Education KD. 4.4 in 2013 Curriculum)

KD 4.4	<p>Civic Education: 4.4 Demonstrating the identified results of ethnicity, religion, race and intergroup in the context of Unity in Diversity.</p> <p>- Civics Education teachers can choose the actual Civic issues on the issues related to differences of opinion between groups in the political years approaching the electoral process which at the end can potentially lead to horizontal conflicts.</p>
4Cs	The Indicators for Competence

	Achievement
<i>Creativity</i>	Individually, students repeat, refine, and present ideas on the actual Civic issues presented by Civics Education teachers in their own way.
<i>Critical Thinking</i>	Students seek for various data sources as a basis for analysis through discussion in groups guided by the Civics Education teacher.
<i>Communication</i>	Each group was asked to read the results of the discussion and other groups who responded
<i>Collaboration</i>	Students draw conclusions together on the Actual Citizenship Issues

III. METHODS

This research was conducted on Junior High School teachers of Civics Education in Surakarta City. This research is designed with qualitative research method to deeply explore and understand the meanings of a problem [9]. The data collection method technically used interviews, observation and documentary studies. In-depth interviews were conducted to teachers of Civics Education at Junior High School in Surakarta City related to Reinforcing Teachers' content knowledge competence of Civics Education through actual civics issues. Researchers' data were strengthened by the results of groups' observations to Junior High School students in Surakarta City in addition to analyzing documents on Civics Education learning materials taught by their teacher classes. The data that was collected were then analyzed by stages including data reduction, data presentation, conclusion drawing, and verification. The procedure of this study eventually resulted in descriptive data on strengthening strategies for Content knowledge competence of Civics Education teachers through the choice of actual issues with the concept of 4Cs skills (Creativity, Critical Thinking, Communication, Collaboration) on Civics Education subject).

IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The results of a research conducted to Civics Education teachers are abbreviated in the following initials FW; DW; RA; AFK; M; I; S; NH; P; SH; WN; MY; HS from several Junior High Schools in Surakarta revealed that most of the Civics Education teachers are currently lacking in terms of the content knowledge competence of Civics Education in providing students with method of analysis over the actual issues, one of which triggered by several things. The first problem concerns the teachers themselves who tend to be deluded and accustomed to 2013 curriculum textbook guidelines. They view textbooks as a complete learning resource accompanied by a number of

case examples and issues, sufficiently observed and analyzed. For further, the textbook is one of the commonly used learning sources. In fact, in Appendix 19 of the Republic of Indonesia Minister of Education and Culture Regulation No. 37, 2018 concerning Amendments to the Minister of Education and Culture Regulation No. 24 of 2016 concerning the Core Competence and Basic Competence Lessons in 2013 Curriculum on Elementary and Middle School Education emphasized that textbooks learning materials need to be developed in combination with other learning sources such as the internet, relevant books and actual issues [4].

The second problem, there is the existing paradigm which argues that Junior High School students in terms of age were not able to discuss issues surrounding the actual Civic issues, consequently the issues are not discussed during the Learning Activities. In fact, on the basis of Peaget's Cognitive Development Theory, middle school age students have come into the formal operational phase, beginning from 11/12 to 18 years old. At this phase, students have been able to think both abstractly and logically using "possible" thinking patterns. In addition, students begin to apply the model of scientific thinking in drawing conclusions and generating hypotheses [6]. Therefore, at that phase, students should be guided to understand and analyze actual Civic issues to draw conclusions an alternative problem resolution. This is reinforced by the results of a research conducted by Greiff [14] that problem-solving ability is a fundamental need which need to be internalized within students living the 21st century as today [14].

The third problem, actual Civics issues are often seen as not having a relationship with Basic Competence, thus, the relationship between them does not need to be discussed. All Basic competencies should be a resolution to real-world problems. Based on the objectives in learning, the application of this approach is substantially expected to be able to provide solutions to the difficulties commonly encountered in real life. The point of success of this model learning program lies in how it promotes the results of Basic Competencies completed in real life, one of which is, individuals need to be able to resist and provide problem resolutions to actual Civic issues [4].

Meanwhile, the research findings obtained through conducting a series of short questions and answers to several students abbreviated with the initials RA, ZB, MDF, MR; AN from several Junior High Schools in the city of Surakarta revealed that, most Junior High School students gained knowledge of Actual Civic issues through the internet, they were free to access and interpret the issues. The results of research to students show that they are perceived as less capable of articulating the subject matter to a number of issues as follows: 1) Issues of hoaxes and political tendencies indoctrinating and organizing public opinion; 2) Controversial issues which have been deliberately disseminated viral for economic purposes caused by certain parties; 3) actual issues which are truly neutral and objective to be followed up as problems of critically need resolutions. Correspondingly, the findings of Park & Rim [19] show that social media can produce the effect of a crisis of trust and impacted for various socially fraud news.

To cope with such problem, one of the ways to improve teachers' content knowledge competence of Civics Education is through implementing the actual Civic issues. At this point, the issues that occurring Civics Education context need to be informed within a neutral perspective. Considering that the unneutral Civics Education actually creates attitudes of distrust at various government institutions [12]. The first step in implementing the actual Civic issues is: Civics Education teachers first need to map actual civic issues, especially

the most viral ones and systematically check the relevance of issues with Basic Competencies, this is because this typical competency will be possible to narrow the scope of issues- the actual civic issue observed, what happened was the analysis of data in the Civics Education learning material showed that the learning material strongly focused on meeting basic competencies, leading to a lack of discussion of actual Civic issues.

The next step is the analysis phase, this stage illustrates that the Civics Education teachers should not be neutral, and bearing the neutrality of the teacher's Civics Education in fact can lead students confusing [5]. In this stage the Civics Education teacher should be able to act as a facilitator, they are able to give direction to students to be able to make the best decisions from various alternatives that have been found. In the analysis phase use the 4Cs model as follows:

Table 4: The Analysis of Actual Civic issues using the 4Cs Skill Concept

4Cs	Indicators of the Competence
	Achievement
<i>Creativity</i>	Students individually repeat, refine, and present an understanding of the actual Civic Issues informed by the Civics Education teacher elaborate in their own ways.
<i>Critical Thinking</i>	Students obtain various data sources as a basis for their analysis through discussion in groups guided by the Civics Education teacher.
<i>Communication</i>	Each group was asked to read the results of their discussion where another group gave their responses
<i>Collaboration</i>	Students draw their conclusions with regard to the Actual Civic issues

At the Creativity phase, teacher(s) at least showed their courage in implementing the Actual Civic issues of today. Certainly, in this case, before the students being informed about the current civic issues, teacher(s) should at the first hand have a broad understanding and rich of information, consequently, this phase requires teachers strengthen their civic literacy competence, either by reading books or seeking information from the internet. Mastering civic literacy is quite fundamental for teachers in creating democratic learning in classroom [13].The importance of mastering civic literacy was also addressed by Boyd & Dobrow [8] that civic literacy, those of which adapted from news that highlights various events in the social environment has significantly positive impact on students' cognitive conditions in the future. The process of potential selecting issues to reinforce civic literacy shall integratively strengthen the teacher's content knowledge Competence of Civic Education. In this process, through civic literacy it enables students mastering competence material, structure, concepts, and scientific mindset which sustain the subject matter [2].

The following is the Civics Education teacher should explore the Actual Civic issues neutrally in a simple and easily understood by students, then the Civics Education teacher should act as a facilitator to provide guidance for students on how the Actual Civic issues can be easily comprehend by students. (Teacher facilitator) that civic literacy, especially through news that highlights various events in society has a positive effect on adolescents in the future. The process of selecting issues by strengthening civic literacy will strengthen teacher's content knowledge competence of Civic Education. In this process, the civic literacy reinforces students to have competence mastery of the material, structure, concepts, and scientific mindset which help them exploring the subject matter [2]

The next phase is the Critical Thinking, the Civics Education teacher(s) should first improve their understanding of the standard competence of the subject being taught, this is sustainable for teachers to think critically in confronting the various Actual Civic issues. A research conducted to 12 countries from Europe and Asia reveal that Civics Education holds a very significant role in being an informant to explicate a country's national goals, including both the ideology and values of a country [20]. In this sense, the neutrality of an issue being analyzed should be gradually reduced and directed towards being the best solution as a problem resolving strategy. Furthermore, the teachers are at least need to able to become facilitators in guiding students to seek for various data sources as a basis for analysis and discussed things within groups. Teacher's guide to thinking concept of the Civics Education teachers is strategically proposed to create boundaries that will enhance students' critical and deep analysis skills according to the subject being analyzed. It will also literally prevent them being deviated from the rules that exist in a country such as ideology and norm of a country. The importance of guardianship for Civics Education in terms of implementing a learning mechanism according to the standard competence of the subject being taught has been enriched and proven by practical researches [18], in that sense, the achievement results of Civics Education rely on the applied learning mechanism. A series of processes carried out by the teacher at this stage strongly influences the teacher's Content knowledge competence of Civics Education in understanding the standard competence of the subjects being taught.

The next phase is the Civics Education teachers who in terms of their roles in school need to provide students capacity in presenting the results of the discussion creatively according to their own ways of elaboration. To effectively do this, it is necessary for teachers to begin focusing the learning outcomes to the phase of understanding instead of just memorizing. This is in line with Boyd & Dobrow [8]'s suggestion that teachers need to apply creative learning media to train students' High Order Thinking Skill (HOTS) in students. This is reinforced by results of the research [15] that critical thinking skills and problem solving are worthy of needed in 21st century education as today. At this phrase, the Civics Education teacher do a series of processes carried out by the teacher which will strengthen the teacher's content knowledge competence of Civics Education in developing the creative learning materials. The last phase is Collaboration; it is the final phase of learning where students begin to draw conclusions together on the analyzed actual citizenship issues. In such a phase, students begin to have perspectives on various alternatives as problem resolutions; this will be the first milestone to establish a smart citizenship in the future. This is in lined with Sommerfeldt & Yang's [22] suggestion that the right decision in understanding the subject matter of the issue on how we are able to produce policies with the maximum benefit. Furthermore, at this phase the Civics Education teachers need to set their own interests to really be present as a

guide for students' thinking concept which enable them to choose the best choice of various alternatives to cope with problems under the existing enacted rules in a country, this as far as the researchers concern, can lead students to be individuals who will be fully understand and obedient to the rules. It will be a great investment for the succeeding excellent citizenship. Teachers' maximum involvement in the of students' thinking concept may lead students having a complete understanding about the civic knowledge; additionally it enables them to have a sharp critical analysis over the actual civic issues. Having implemented this strategy, students will be able to realize their civic skills into problem resolutions. The way students conceptually think shall lead them to have a good civic disposition in dealing with the applicable civic values in a country. The combination between the civic knowledge, civic skills and civic disposition in managing the actual civic issues can create a smart and good succeeding generation in the future who can wisely act as problem solvers to various problems. This series of processes strengthens Content knowledge competence of Civics Education teachers in enhancing their professionalism as responsible educators and tasked with educating the nation's life [2]. This series of processes was carried out by fully maximized the potential use of information and communication technology in the 21st century. A research conducted by van Laar, van Deursen, van Dijk, & de Haan [23] who suggested that, in the 21st century as it is today, all innovations in science are available through digital access. Meanwhile, other researchers suggested that digital skills mastery in the 21st century is importantly effective strategy in increasing work professionalism [24]. This ultimately increases teacher's content knowledge competence of Civics Education related to the use of information and communication technology oriented to enhance teachers' self-developments.

V. CONCLUSION

The research concludes that Civic issues have been a real practice in reinforcing the teacher's knowledge competence of Civic Education. Implementing the actual Civic issues shows teachers' commitment for the Civics Education teaching professionalism. The Actual Civic issues were analyzed through using both the existing information and communication technology; we found that these have been the most effective media in reinforcing teachers' knowledge competence of Civics Education as a means of teachers' self-developing activities. Furthermore, the guiding teachers shall sharpen their analytical process of the actual Civic issues that will synergically reinforce teachers' knowledge competence of Civic Education, including how individuals can perfectly master the materials, structure, concepts, and scientific mindset. Additionally, the use of 4Cs skills concept (Creativity, Critical Thinking, Communication, and Collaboration) reinforce students' Actual Civic issues in addition to establishing their creative learning environment. The idea of reinforcing teachers' knowledge competence of Civics Education through a series of processes was carried out in accordance with the standard competence of the subjects being taught. The results conclude that the increasing the teachers' content knowledge competence of the Civics Education through implementing the Actual Civic issues specifically which employ the 4Cs Skills Concept (Creativity, Critical Thinking, Communication, Collaboration) in Civics Education Subject in accordance with the standard competence to cope with the students' needs of learning material in the 21century.

VI. ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The writer wishes to thank lecturers of the Pancasila and Civics Education Study Program (PPKn) of Postgraduate Sebelas Maret University in Surakarta. In addition to teachers of Civic Education subject at Junior High School in Surakarta who have been generously and voluntarily engaged and participated in this research.

REFERENCES

1. J. J. Cogan, *Developing the Civic Society: The Role of Civics Education*. Bandung: CISED, 1999.
2. Indonesian Minister of National Education Regulation Number 16 of 2007, "concerning Academic Qualification Standards and Teacher Competencies".
3. Indonesian Republic Law Number 14 of 2005, "Concerning Teachers and Lecturers".
4. Republic of Indonesia Minister of Education and Culture Regulation No. 37 of 2018 concerning Amendments to the Minister of Education and Culture Regulation No. 24 of 2016 concerning "the Core Competencies and Basic Competency Lessons on 2013", Curriculum in Basic Education and Secondary Education has been emphasized here must be developed
5. M. N. Somantri, *Menggagas Pembaharuan Pendidikan IPS*. Bandung: Rosda Karya, 2001.
6. P. Suparno, *Teori Perkembangan Kognitif Jean Piaget*. Jogjakarta: Kanisius, 2007.
7. Winarno, *Pembelajaran Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan: Isi, Strategi, dan Penilaian*, Jakarta: BumiAksara, 2012.
8. M. J. Boyd, & J. Dobrow, "Chapter 10 - Media literacy and positive youth development." In R. M. Lerner, J. V. Lerner, & J. B. Benson (Eds.), *Advances in Child Development and Behavior*, JAI, vol. 41, 2011, pp. 251-271.
9. J. W. Creswell, *Research design: qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approach*. (4th Eds.). Thousand Oaks, California: SAGE Publications, 2014.
10. J. S. Damico, & A. Panos, "Civic media literacy as 21st century source work: Future social studies teachers examine web sources about climate change", *The Journal of Social Studies Research*, vol.42, (4), 2018, pp. 345-359. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jssr.2017.10.001>
11. G. Dunne, *beyond critical thinking to critical being: Criticality in higher education and life*. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 71, 2015, pp.86-99. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijer.2015.03.003>
12. S. E. Finkel, C. A. Sabatini, & G. G. Bevis, "Civic Education, Civil Society, and Political Mistrust in a Developing Democracy: The Case of the Dominican Republic", *World Development*, vol.28, (11), 2000, pp. 1851-1874. doi:[https://doi.org/10.1016/S0305-750X\(00\)00067-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0305-750X(00)00067-X)
13. K. Flornes, "Chapter 3 - Promoting Civic Literacy in Teacher Education: A Framework for Personal and Professional Development". In S. Ingvaldsen & D. Oberg (Eds.), *Media and Information Literacy in Higher Education*, Chandos Publishing, 2017, pp. 37-50.
14. S. Greiff, S. Wüstenberg, B. Csapó, A. Demetriou, J. Hautamäki, A. C. Graesser, & R. Martin, "Domain-general problem solving skills and education in the 21st century", *Educational Research Review*, vol.13, 2014, pp.74-83. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.edurev.2014.10.002>

15. T. Hidayat, E. Susilaningih, & C. Kurniawan, "The effectiveness of enrichment test instruments design to measure students' creative thinking skills and problem-solving". *Thinking Skills and Creativity*, 29, 2018, pp.161-169. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tsc.2018.02.011>
16. A. Mossalam, Projects' issue management. *HBRC Journal*, vol.14, (3), 2018, pp. 400-407. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.hbrcj.2017.12.001>
17. R.P. Vegitya, *Denizenship: Kontestasi dan Hibridisasi Ideologi di Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: PolGov, 2012.
18. F. Nogueira, & A. Moreira, "A Framework for Civics Education Teachers' Knowledge". *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, vol.47, 2012, pp.1179-1183. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.06.797>
19. K. Park, & H. Rim, Social media hoaxes, political ideology, and the role of issue confidence. *Telematics and Informatics*, vol.36, 2019, pp.1-11. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tele.2018.11.001>
20. F. Reichert, & J. Torney-Purta, A cross-national comparison of teachers' beliefs about the aims of Civics Education in 12 countries: A person-centered analysis. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, vol.77, 2019, pp.112-125. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2018.09.005>
21. V. Smetanová, A. Drbalová, & D. Vitáková, "Implicit Theories of Critical Thinking in Teachers and Future Teachers", *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, vol.171, 2015, pp.724-732. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.01.184>
22. E. J. Sommerfeldt, & A. Yang, "Relationship networks as strategic issues management: An issue-stage framework of social movement organization network strategies", *Public Relations Review*, vol.43, (4), 2017, pp. 829-839. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2017.06.012>
23. E. van Laar, A. J. A. M. van Deursen, J. A. G. M. van Dijk, & J. de Haan, The relation between 21st-century skills and digital skills: A systematic literature review, *Computers in Human Behavior*, vol.72, 2017, pp.577-588. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2017.03.010>
24. E. van Laar, A. J. A. M. van Deursen, J. A. G. M. van Dijk, & J. de Haan, "21st-century digital skills instrument aimed at working professionals: Conceptual development and empirical validation", *Telematics and Informatics*, vol.35, (8), 2018, pp. 2184-2200. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tele.2018.08.006>
25. Ö. B. Yoldaş, "Civics Education and Learning Democracy: Their Importance for Political Participation of Young People", *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, vol.174, 2015, pp.544-549. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.01.703>
26. A. Zohar, & A. Cohen, "Large scale implementation of higher order thinking (HOT) in Civic Education: The interplay of policy, politics, pedagogical leadership and detailed pedagogical planning". *Thinking Skills and Creativity*, vol.21, 2016, pp.85-96. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tsc.2016.05.003>