

Four-Frame Leadership Orientations and Job Performance Amongst Jakarta Working Adults

¹Gary Christanto Hung, ²Benjamin Chan Yin Fah, ³Robby Kwok Wai Wong

Abstract--*This study examined the differences in leadership orientations on employee job performance in the context of Bolman and Deal's four-frame leadership theory and highlighted on whether there are any differences with the younger generation. Information for the study was gathered through self-administered questionnaire and non-probability convenience sampling method. A total of 180 completed and usable questionnaires have been gathered up amongst working adults in Jakarta. The findings revealed that different variables yielded different influences for leadership orientations and job performance in terms of gender, age, marital status, job position, and length of work. In four-frame leadership types, Symbolic Frame has the most significant influence for job performance, compared with Political Frame that has the lightest influences. The regression analysis shows that Structural Frame and Symbolic Frame are the predictors for job performance. This study is important to assist potential leaders to adapt better with Jakarta's working condition. It is vital for leaders to realise how to increase and maintain good job performance by acknowledging the importance of having different leadership type, which also could help organisations to choose the right leaders or managers that can lead them toward success.*

Keywords--*Leadership, job, performance, leader, organization*

I. Introduction

Organisations and employees are two things that cannot be separated, as employees have a very important role in carrying out the life of the organisation and they are one of active actors in every activity in the organisation (Mochklas, Pinaraswati, and Setiawan, 2018). Hence, improving performance of employees to organisations has long been an interest for human resource development (HRD) researchers and professionals (Lee and Welliver, 2018). Although, managing performance is becoming difficult due to workplace pressures, growing bureaucracy, and low levels of motivation (Jacobsen and Andersen, 2015).

Lately the number of older workers have increased in several countries such as USA, European Union, and including Indonesia. According to predominant beliefs, older workers are worse performers and are less motivated than younger generations (Abraham and Hansson, 1995; Shore, Cleveland, and Goldberg, 2003), have a lower

¹ Asia Pacific University of Technology and Innovation, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, Carlton College, Hong Kong
E-mail: gary_c_h37@hotmail.com/+60172640152

² Asia Pacific University of Technology and Innovation, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, Carlton College, Hong Kong
E-mail: gary_c_h37@hotmail.com/+60172640152

³ Asia Pacific University of Technology and Innovation, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, Carlton College, Hong Kong
E-mail: gary_c_h37@hotmail.com/+60172640152

ability to learn (Brooke and Taylor, 2005; Wrenn and Maurer, 2004), and are more costly for companies (Capowski and Peak, 1994; Ostroff and Atwater, 2003).

Several empirical researches have also been conducted on the stereotypes that went around older workers for a long time. Empirical research has demonstrated most of the common stereotypes to be unfounded (Kunze, Boehm, and Bruch, 2013). For example, extensive research has shown the negative age/job performance stereotype to be wrong (e.g. Kanfer and Ackerman, 2004; Ng and Feldman, 2008), while other studies have found training success and age, as well as the relation between costs and older workers, to be unrelated (Broadbridge, 2001).

Yin-Fah (2010) found that older workers showed no differences with younger workers where they are able to work with an average of seven hours a day. Even in terms of recruitment, HR personals considered that specific skills and experience are the strongest bargaining power holds by adult workers to be recruited or reemployed (YaQiong and Yin-Fah, 2016). Even though small group of HR personnel considered their older workers to be lazy, costly and with bad attitude, majority of them have a more positive view (Yin-Fah et al., 2010).

On the other hand, studies on leadership have been giving significant impact on job performance as well. This has been proved in literature where leadership behaviors have positive influence on job performances of employees (Kundu, Kumar, and Gahlawat, 2019). Other studies also mentioned about how leaders who practised the right leadership style could effectively manage employee performance (Liu et al., 2013). Leaders are believed to play a critical role in employee performance (Choudhary et al., 2017), because they have been found to influence employees in many ways, including coordinating, communicating, training, motivating, and rewarding (Yukl, 1989). Several researchers and scholars asserted that a good leadership style matters in an organisation (Vandenabeele, Andersen, and Leisink, 2013), and leaders have actually adapted many leadership styles to maintain the employees' performance.

These past studies have successfully pointed out how factor such as leadership could give significant impacts to performance, as well as how the society view the adult workers in the ageing society. *However*, less attention has been given to the perceived leadership and its effects toward employee performance amongst the working adults. Therefore, this study aims to find out how leadership orientations suggested by Bolman and Deal will cover the job performance amongst working adults in Jakarta, Indonesia. The four-frame leadership theory suggested by Bolman and Deal (1991, 1997) has four essential components: *structural, human resource, political, and symbolic*. The theory assumes that these four orientations or frames represent the ways in which leaders perceive organisational situations, and in turn shape how these respective situations are defined and the manners in which they can be managed most effectively.

Research objectives and significance of study

This research is going to determine the leadership type on employee job performance amongst working adults in Jakarta, and to examine whether there is a difference between younger generation (aged 25-39) and older generation (aged 40 and above) in terms of their performance. This research will contribute to Bolman and Deal's leadership orientation theory expansion, especially for the present body of literature on leadership in Jakarta, Indonesia. This

study would provide the leaders or managers in Jakarta with the insights needed to ensure greater leadership effectiveness in increasing employee performance amongst working adults. More importantly, the study would highlight the effectiveness of four-frame leadership style suggested by Bolman and Deal in helping managers or leaders to give a proper training, improving not only employees' performance, but also organisational effectiveness. Academicians and future researchers who are researching about the role of four-frame leadership style in enhancing the performance of employees would also benefit from this research as the findings of this study can support and supplement their own research findings on this subject matter in the future.

II. Literature review

Job performance refers to the success or the overall outcomes of an employee during a particular period that is compared with work standards, criteria and target (Rivai, 2004). In another study, job performance is considered as the total expected value to the organisation of the discrete behavioural episodes that an individual carries out over a standard period of time (Motowildlo, 2003). Individual performance is most of the time determined by motivation and the will and ability to do the job (Menges et al., 2016). The dimensions of job performance can differ amongst jobs and there are a high number of measures as indicators of employees' job performance. Usually, the literature on job performance focuses on two factors: the importance of sustaining high job performance by employees and finding the best ways to maximise job performance (Akgunduz, 2015). High job performance increases employees' competitive capacity, assists in meeting targeted goals, and increases their self-confidence and job satisfaction (Sonnentag and Frese, 2002).

On the other hand, individuals have been enamored with the ways in which leaders have successfully managed groups of people, organisations, and government toward fulfilling objectives and goals (Thompson, 2000), and it was said that the success of an organisation is reliant on leaders' ability to optimise human resources. It has been widely accepted that effective organisations require effective leadership and that organisational performance will suffer in direct proportion to the neglect of this (Fiedler and House, 1988). All different dimensions of leadership such as behaviour, leadership training, reward and punishment, charismatic, transformational, situational, and contingency leadership theories are all related directly to the work of Bolman and Deal (1991,1997) and Quinn (1988) where they acknowledged multitude of measurable variables in leadership effectiveness and using multiframe approach in understanding the personal attributes, leadership style, and situational contexts of leadership behaviour. Bolman and Deal's four-frame leadership style consists of structural, human resource, political, and symbolic frame. It pictures on how leaders think and respond to different situation through multiple frames. Structural and human resource frames are related more into the management, as for political and symbolic frames are related into leadership.

Two theories are used in this study, which are Bolman and Deal's (1991) four-frame leadership theory that has been discussed previously. Second, the family resource management model suggested by Deacon and Firebaugh in 1988, which consists of input, throughput, and output that gave a clear picture and basis for this study of leadership orientations and respondents' characteristics toward individual job performance.

III. Materials And Methods

Research design and sampling methodology

This is a quantitative study, and in terms of objectives, it is an explanatory study. As for the sample population in this study is the working adults in Jakarta, Indonesia. Looking into the sampling methodology, this study used non-probability convenience sampling method, which was conducted amongst 180 working adults in Jakarta, Indonesia.

Instrumentation

To assess the individual job performance, the IWPQ (Individual Work Performance Questionnaire) 1.0 was adopted from Koopmans et al. (2014), which consists of 3 sub domains (task performance, contextual performance, and counterproductive work behaviour), with a total number of 18 items altogether and using five-point ordinal scale (1=never to 5=always).

As for leadership orientations, a total of 32 items from 4 sub domains (structural, human resource, political, and symbolic) were adopted from Bolman and Deal (1991). Each of the frames contains 8 items and required the participants to indicate how often each items was true using five point ordinal scale (1=never to 5=always). The greater the score, the more it indicates the tendencies toward the particular leadership types.

IV. Results And Discussion

Descriptive analysis was prepared for each variable as well as the differences with the socio-demographic profile of respondents, such as gender, age, marital status, job position, and length of work. From the analysis, 180 respondents data were gathered after eliminating the 4 invalid data. Most of the respondents are male (112 out of 180), younger generation group (aged 25-39) (100 out of 180), single (97 out of 180), came from operational staffs level (41 out of 180), and most of the respondents have 5 years and below working experience (89 out of 180).

Based on the independent sample T-test, marital status was found not significant towards the individual job performance. Through one-way ANOVA test, job position and length of work were also found not significant toward the individual job performance. Multiple regression analysis proved that beside gender and length of work, only age group was significant towards the individual job performance.

Pearson moment correlation and multiple regression tests were used to test the developed hypotheses. Results from Pearson moment correlation shows that structural frame ($r = 0.372$, $p \leq 0.01$), human resource frame ($r = 0.375$, $p \leq 0.01$), political frame ($r = 0.356$, $p \leq 0.01$), and symbolic frame ($r = 0.397$, $p \leq 0.01$) were significant toward individual job performance. The relationships are positive and weak.

Multiple regression analysis was conducted to decide which of the selected independent variables (structural frame, human resource frame, political frame, and symbolic frame) would influence the individual job performance. Based on the model summary table, 25% of the overall variance of individual job performance is justified by the overall facts of Structural Frame, Human Resource Frame, Political Frame, and Symbolic Frame. Meanwhile, the remaining 75% could be accounted for other factors or independent variables that were not included in this study. Derived from ANOVA table, it shows that the individual job performance is adequate to be studied, and the F

statistic produced ($F=9.525$) was found significant at 0.05, which means that the independent variables in this study (Structural Frame, Human Resource Frame, Political Frame, and Symbolic Frame) were statistically significant predictors of employee's Job Performance.

To determine how much contribution each variable gives and impacts, further analysis was taken through the coefficients table, which proved that only Structural Frame and Symbolic Frame are the *predictors*, in which they have relationship with significant level below 0.05. Out of the two predictors, Structural Frame is the strongest one ($\beta= .231$). As for the demographic profile, only age group was significant. The age group consists of 2, younger generation (aged 25-39) and older generation (aged 40 and above), and from the result taken, the younger generation group turned out to perform better than the older generation, based on the values of B and Beta (-4.036 and -.255).

After excluding the non-significant variables, the generated equation was applied to know how much the employee's job performance is expected to increase when the independent variable increases by one unit as follows:

$$\text{Employee's Job Performance} = 38.268 + 0.420 \text{ Structural Frame} + 0.300 \text{ Symbolic Frame}$$

This indicated that a single standard deviation increase in structural frame brings 0.420 standard deviation increase in individual job performance and vice versa (positive impact). Same goes for symbolic frame, where a single standard deviation increase in symbolic frame brings 0.300 standard deviation increase in individual job performance and vice versa (positive impact)

V. Conclusion

This study found that only age group influenced individual job performance. In addition, only Structural Frame and Symbolic Frame have influence over individual job performance amongst working adults in Jakarta, Indonesia, with younger generation (aged 25-39) turned out to perform better than the older generation (aged 40 and above).

The findings of this study have several implications that would be beneficial to future leaders or managers, organisations, as well as future academicians or researchers. This study has contributed further insight into existing literature of leadership and factors that influenced it. The information provided in the study will help the leaders or managers as well as companies to recognise the importance of leadership in improving the employee performance. It is also hoped that the current study will help in identifying new areas for further research on factors that influence employee job performance.

It is important for organisations to emphasis more on the implementation of Structural Frame and Symbolic Frame in their training programs, communications, and other work activities. Moreover, nurturing the younger generation in various sectors is also encouraged, as younger generation tends to learn adapt faster, and also have bright inputs if stimulated with proper approaches. This in hope would help in improving and maintaining the employee job performance so that it would yield in high outputs. The future research may also try to focus on other sectors as well to see whether the study has similar implications, as this study has different implications compared to the previous ones.

As this study was only conducted in Jakarta, Indonesia, future research on similar topic could be made out on another placement of Indonesia, as Indonesia has a total of 34 provinces altogether, with different cultures and environment. In the future, it is also encouraged to narrow down to particular or specific working sectors, as this study was way too general due to number of respondents that came from different organisation backgrounds. Since the total number of respondents was 180 people, a larger sample would also be more favourable, as a much larger research sample would have been more representative of the research population.

Acknowledgements

My deepest and utmost gratitude goes to my supervisor **Assoc. Prof. Dr. Benjamin Chan Yin Fah**, who has provided me with unlimited amount of encouragement, knowledge, guidance and feedbacks that put me on the right track, and has been accompanying me all along my study and completion of this study. His profound knowledge and countless amount of accumulated experience, along with his patience in guiding me, has led and gave a positive impact on the study. Though it may sound like an exaggeration, I might not have completed it in time without his guidance. I would also like to say thank you for giving me the opportunity to convert my research paper into this study and guiding me in completing it.

References

1. Abraham, J. and Hansson, R. (1995) Successful Aging at Work: An Applied Study of Selection, Optimization, and Compensation Through Impression Management. *The Journals of Gerontology Series B Psychological Sciences and Social Sciences*, [online] 50(2), pp.94-103. Available at: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/15441029_Successful_Aging_at_Work_An_Applied_Study_of_Selection_Optimization_and_Compensation_Through_Impression_Management [Accessed 19 February 2019].
2. Akgunduz, Y. (2015) The Influence of Self-Esteem and Role Stress on Job Performance in Hotel Businesses. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, [online] 27(6), pp.1082-1099. Available at: <http://www.emeraldinsight.com/doi/full/10.1108/IJCHM-09-2013-0421> [Accessed 29 February 2019].
3. Bolman, L. and Deal, T. (1991) Leadership and Management Effectiveness: A Multi-Frame, Multi-Sector Analysis. *Human Resource Management*, [online] 30(4), pp.509-534. Available at: <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/hrm.3930300406> [Accessed 26 February 2019].
4. Bolman, L. and Deal, T. (1997) Reframing Organizations. [online] Available at: <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/book/10.1002/9781119281856> [Accessed 26 February 2019].
5. Broadbridge, A. (2001) Ageism in Retailing: Myth or Reality?. In: I. Glover and M. Branine. (eds). *Ageism in Work and Employment*, 1st Ed. [online] London, p.22. Available at: <https://www.taylorfrancis.com/books/e/9781351735711/chapters/10.4324/9781351185972-20> [Accessed 23 February 2019].
6. Brooke, L. and Taylor, P. (2005) Older Workers and Employment: Managing Age Relations. *Ageing and Society*, [online] 25(03), pp.415-429. Available at: <https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/ageing-and-society/article/older-workers-and-employment-managing-age-relations/9CB6054C38A1E6B6DB4488BE713E4C90> [Accessed 19 February 2019].
7. Capowski, G. and Peak, M. (1994) Ageism: The New Diversity Issue. *Management Review*, [online] 83(10), pp.10-15. Available at: <https://search.proquest.com/docview/206708762/fulltextPDF/A6EE2E9E78B44964PQ/1?accountid=46052> [Accessed 19 February 2019].
8. Choudhary, N., Naqshbandi, M., Philip, P. and Kumar, R. (2017) Employee Job Performance. *Journal of Management Development*, [online] 36(8), pp.1087-1098. Available at: <http://www.emeraldinsight.com/doi/full/10.1108/JMD-10-2016-0195#> [Accessed 20 February 2019].
9. Deacon, R. E. and Firebaugh, F. M. (1988) *Family Resource Management: Principles and Applications*, 2nd Ed. Boston: Allyn& Bacon.

10. Fiedler, F. E., & House, R. J. (1988) Leadership Theory and Research: A Report of Progress. In: Cooper C. L., and Robertson I. T. (eds). *International Review of Industrial and Organizational Psychology 1988*, pp. 73-92. Oxford, England: John Wiley & Sons.
11. Jacobsen, C. and Andersen, L. (2015) Is Leadership in the Eye of the Beholder? A Study of Intended and Perceived Leadership Practices and Organizational Performance. *Public Administration Review*, [online] 75(6), pp.829-841. Available at: <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/puar.12380> [Accessed 18 February 2019].
12. Kanfer, R. and Ackerman, P. (2004) Aging, Adult Development, and Work Motivation. *The Academy of Management Review*, [online] 29(3), p.440. Available at: <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/4170/16e7fb9ee6e8b4e03c48cf55af3c0423e4a9.pdf> [Accessed 23 February 2019].
13. Koopmans, L., Bernaards, C., Hildebrandt, V., de Vet, H. and van der Beek, A. (2014) Construct Validity of the Individual Work Performance Questionnaire. *Journal of Occupational and Environmental Medicine*, [online] 56(3), pp.331-337. Available at: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/24561507> [Accessed 26 February 2019].
14. Kundu, S., Kumar, S. and Gahlawat, N. (2019) Empowering Leadership and Job Performance: Mediating Role of Psychological Empowerment. *Management Research Review*. [online] Available at: <http://www.emeraldinsight.com/doi/full/10.1108/MRR-04-2018-0183> [Accessed 23 February 2019].
15. Kunze, F., Boehm, S. and Bruch, H. (2013) Age, Resistance to Change, and Job Performance. *Journal of Managerial Psychology*, [online] 28(7/8), pp.741-760. Available at: <http://www.emeraldinsight.com/doi/full/10.1108/JMP-06-2013-0194> [Accessed 23 February 2019].
16. Lee, J. and Welliver, M. (2018) The Role of Strategic Leadership for Learning on The Relationship Between Training Opportunities and Salesperson Job Performance and Commitment. *European Journal of Training and Development*, [online] 42(9), pp.558-576. Available at: <https://www.emeraldinsight.com/doi/full/10.1108/EJTD-08-2017-0068> [Accessed 18 February 2019].
17. Liu, Z., Cai, Z., Li, J., Shi, S. and Fang, Y. (2013) Leadership Style and Employee Turnover Intentions: A Social Identity Perspective. *Career Development International*, [online] 18(3), pp.305-324. Available at: <https://www.emeraldinsight.com/doi/full/10.1108/CDI-09-2012-0087> [Accessed 23 February 2019].
18. Menges, J., Tussing, D., Wihler, A. and Grant, A. (2016) When Job Performance is All Relative: How Family Motivation Energizes Effort and Compensates for Intrinsic Motivation. *Academy of Management Journal*, [online] 60(2), pp.695-719. Available at: <https://journals.aom.org/doi/10.5465/amj.2014.0898> [Accessed 28 February 2019].
19. Mochklas, M., Pinaraswati, S. and Setiawan, T. (2018) How Motivation Works, Indonesian Employees in Foreign Companies?. *Sinergi*, [online] 8(2). Available at: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/327918469_HOW_MOTIVATION_WORKS_INDONESIAN_EMPL_OYEEES_IN_FOREIGN_COMPANIES [Accessed 18 February 2019].
20. Motowildlo, S. J. (2003) Job Performance. In: Borman, W. C., Ilgen, D. R., & Klimoski, R. J. (eds). *Handbook of Psychology* pp. 39-54. Hoboken, New Jersey: Wiley.
21. Ng, T. and Feldman, D. (2008) The Relationship of Age to Ten Dimensions of Job Performance. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, [online] 93(2), pp.392-423. Available at: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/18361640> [Accessed 23 February 2019].
22. Ostroff, C. and Atwater, L. (2003) Does Whom You Work with Matter? Effects of Referent Group Gender and Age Composition on Managers' Compensation. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, [online] 88(4), pp.725-740. Available at: <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/a6db/0481c2ea0f766e3132acd3ec155b0a7c7091.pdf> [Accessed 19 February 2019].
23. Rivai, V. (2004) *Performance Appraisal*. Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada.
24. Sonnentag, S. and Frese, M. (2002) Performance Concepts and Performance Theory. *Psychological Management of Individual Performance*, [online] 23(1), pp.3-25. Available at: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/291062476_Performance_Concepts_and_Performance_Theory [Accessed 1 March 2019].
25. Thompson, M. (2000) Gender, Leadership Orientation, and Effectiveness: Testing the Theoretical Models of Bolman & Deal and Quinn. *Sex Roles*, [online] 42(11/12), pp.969-992. Available at: <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1023/A:1007032500072> [Accessed 27 February 2019].

26. Vandenberghe, W., Andersen, L. and Leisink, P. (2013) Leadership in the Public Sector: A Tale of General Principles and Particular Features. *Review of Public Personnel Administration*, [online] 34(2), pp.79-83. Available at: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0734371X13511160> [Accessed 20 February 2019].
27. YaQiong, D. and Yin-Fah, B. (2016) Four Frame Leadership Orientations and Job Performance among Beijing Working Adults. *International Business Management*, [online] 10(16), pp.3575-3579. Available at: <http://www.medwelljournals.com/abstract/?doi=ibm.2016.3575.3579> [Accessed 25 February 2019].
28. Yin-Fah, B. (2010) Perception of Human Resource Personnel Towards Malaysia Older Workers. *The Journal of International Social Research*, [online] 3(14). Available at: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/221717249_Perception_of_Human_Resource_Personnel_towards_Malaysia_Older_Workers [Accessed 24 February 2019].
29. Yin-Fah, B., Hamid, T., Masud, J. and Paim, L. (2010) Predictors of Financial Dependency in Old Age in Peninsular Malaysia: An Ethnicity Comparison. *Asian Social Science*, [online] 6(6). Available at: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/43920230_Predictors_of_Financial_Dependency_in_Old_Age_in_Peninsular_Malaysia_An_Ethnicity_Comparison [Accessed 25 February 2019].
30. Yukl, G. (1989) *Leadership in Organization*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.